

# Heavy Bosons Other Than Higgs Bosons, Searches for

We list here various limits on charged and neutral heavy vector bosons (other than  $W$ 's and  $Z$ 's), heavy scalar bosons (other than Higgs bosons), vector or scalar leptoquarks, and axiglons.

## $W_R$ (Right-Handed $W$ Boson) MASS LIMITS

Assuming a light right-handed neutrino, except for BEALL 82, LANGACKER 89B, and COLANGELO 91.  $g_R = g_L$  assumed. [Limits in the section MASS LIMITS for  $W'$  below are also valid for  $W_R$  if  $m_{\nu_R} \ll m_{W_R}$ .] Some limits assume manifest left-right symmetry, *i.e.*, the equality of left- and right Cabibbo-Kobayashi-Maskawa matrices. For a comprehensive review, see LANGACKER 89B. Limits on the  $W_L$ - $W_R$  mixing angle  $\zeta$  are found in the next section. Values in brackets are from cosmological and astrophysical considerations and assume a light right-handed neutrino.

VALUE (GeV)	CL%	DOCUMENT ID	TECN	COMMENT
<b>&gt; 549</b>		<sup>1</sup> BARENBOIM 97	RVUE	$\mu$ decay
● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ●				
> 220	95	<sup>2</sup> STAHL 97	RVUE	$\tau$ decay
> 220	90	<sup>3</sup> ALLET 96	CNTR	$\beta^+$ decay
> 281	90	<sup>4</sup> KUZNETSOV 95	CNTR	Polarized neutron decay
> 282	90	<sup>5</sup> KUZNETSOV 94B	CNTR	Polarized neutron decay
> 439	90	<sup>6</sup> BHATTACH... 93	RVUE	$Z$ - $Z'$ mixing
> 250	90	<sup>7</sup> SEVERIJNS 93	CNTR	$\beta^+$ decay
		<sup>8</sup> IMAZATO 92	CNTR	$K^+$ decay
> 475	90	<sup>9</sup> POLAK 92B	RVUE	$\mu$ decay
> 240	90	<sup>10</sup> AQUINO 91	RVUE	Neutron decay
> 496	90	<sup>10</sup> AQUINO 91	RVUE	Neutron and muon decay
> 700		<sup>11</sup> COLANGELO 91	THEO	$m_{K_L^0} - m_{K_S^0}$
> 477	90	<sup>12</sup> POLAK 91	RVUE	$\mu$ decay
[none 540-23000]		<sup>13</sup> BARBIERI 89B	ASTR	SN 1987A; light $\nu_R$
> 300	90	<sup>14</sup> LANGACKER 89B	RVUE	General
> 160	90	<sup>15</sup> BALKE 88	CNTR	$\mu \rightarrow e\nu\bar{\nu}$
> 406	90	<sup>16</sup> JODIDIO 86	ELEC	Any $\zeta$
> 482	90	<sup>16</sup> JODIDIO 86	ELEC	$\zeta = 0$
> 800		MOHAPATRA 86	RVUE	$SU(2)_L \times SU(2)_R \times U(1)$
> 400	95	<sup>17</sup> STOKER 85	ELEC	Any $\zeta$
> 475	95	<sup>17</sup> STOKER 85	ELEC	$\zeta < 0.041$
		<sup>18</sup> BERGSMA 83	CHRM	$\nu_\mu e \rightarrow \mu\nu_e$
> 380	90	<sup>19</sup> CARR 83	ELEC	$\mu^+$ decay
>1600		<sup>20</sup> BEALL 82	THEO	$m_{K_L^0} - m_{K_S^0}$
[> 4000]		STEIGMAN 79	COSM	Nucleosynthesis; light $\nu_R$

<sup>1</sup> The quoted limit is from  $\mu$  decay parameters. BARENBOIM 97 also evaluate limit from  $K_L$ - $K_S$  mass difference.

<sup>2</sup> STAHL 97 limit is from fit to  $\tau$ -decay parameters.

- <sup>3</sup> ALLET 96 measured polarization-asymmetry correlaton in  $^{12}\text{N}\beta^+$  decay. The listed limit assumes zero  $L$ - $R$  mixing.
- <sup>4</sup> KUZNETSOV 95 limit is from measurements of the asymmetry  $\langle \vec{p}_\nu \cdot \sigma_n \rangle$  in the  $\beta$  decay of polarized neutrons. Zero mixing assumed. See also KUZNETSOV 94B.
- <sup>5</sup> KUZNETSOV 94B limit is from measurements of the asymmetry  $\langle \vec{p}_\nu \cdot \sigma_n \rangle$  in the  $\beta$  decay of polarized neutrons. Zero mixing assumed.
- <sup>6</sup> BHATTACHARYYA 93 uses  $Z$ - $Z'$  mixing limit from LEP '90 data, assuming a specific Higgs sector of  $\text{SU}(2)_L \times \text{SU}(2)_R \times \text{U}(1)$  gauge model. The limit is for  $m_t=200$  GeV and slightly improves for smaller  $m_t$ .
- <sup>7</sup> SEVERIJNS 93 measured polarization-asymmetry correlation in  $^{107}\text{In}\beta^+$  decay. The listed limit assumes zero  $L$ - $R$  mixing. Value quoted here is from SEVERIJNS 94 erratum.
- <sup>8</sup> IMAZATO 92 measure positron asymmetry in  $K^+ \rightarrow \mu^+ \nu_\mu$  decay and obtain  $\xi P_\mu > 0.990$  (90%CL). If  $W_R$  couples to  $u\bar{s}$  with full weak strength ( $V_{us}^R=1$ ), the result corresponds to  $m_{W_R} > 653$  GeV. See their Fig.4 for  $m_{W_R}$  limits for general  $|V_{us}^R|^2=1-|V_{ud}^R|^2$ .
- <sup>9</sup> POLAK 92B limit is from fit to muon decay parameters and is essentially determined by JODIDIO 86 data assuming  $\zeta=0$ . Supersedes POLAK 91.
- <sup>10</sup> AQUINO 91 limits obtained from neutron lifetime and asymmetries together with unitarity of the CKM matrix. Manifest left-right symmetry assumed. Stronger of the two limits also includes muon decay results.
- <sup>11</sup> COLANGELO 91 limit uses hadronic matrix elements evaluated by QCD sum rule and is less restrictive than BEALL 82 limit which uses vacuum saturation approximation. Manifest left-right symmetry assumed.
- <sup>12</sup> POLAK 91 limit is from fit to muon decay parameters and is essentially determined by JODIDIO 86 data assuming  $\zeta=0$ . Superseded by POLAK 92B.
- <sup>13</sup> BARBIERI 89B limit holds for  $m_{\nu_R} \leq 10$  MeV.
- <sup>14</sup> LANGACKER 89B limit is for any  $\nu_R$  mass (either Dirac or Majorana) and for a general class of right-handed quark mixing matrices.
- <sup>15</sup> BALKE 88 limit is for  $m_{\nu_{eR}} = 0$  and  $m_{\nu_{\mu R}} \leq 50$  MeV. Limits come from precise measurements of the muon decay asymmetry as a function of the positron energy.
- <sup>16</sup> JODIDIO 86 is the same TRIUMF experiment as STOKER 85 (and CARR 83); however, it uses a different technique. The results given here are combined results of the two techniques. The technique here involves precise measurement of the end-point  $e^+$  spectrum in the decay of the highly polarized  $\mu^+$ .
- <sup>17</sup> STOKER 85 is same TRIUMF experiment as CARR 83. Here they measure the decay  $e^+$  spectrum asymmetry above 46 MeV/ $c$  using a muon-spin-rotation technique. Assumed a light right-handed neutrino. Quoted limits are from combining with CARR 83.
- <sup>18</sup> BERGSMA 83 set limit  $m_{W_2}/m_{W_1} > 1.9$  at CL = 90%.
- <sup>19</sup> CARR 83 is TRIUMF experiment with a highly polarized  $\mu^+$  beam. Looked for deviation from  $V-A$  at the high momentum end of the decay  $e^+$  energy spectrum. Limit from previous world-average muon polarization parameter is  $m_{W_R} > 240$  GeV. Assumes a light right-handed neutrino.
- <sup>20</sup> BEALL 82 limit is obtained assuming that  $W_R$  contribution to  $K_L^0-K_S^0$  mass difference is smaller than the standard one, neglecting the top quark contributions. Manifest left-right symmetry assumed.

### Limit on $W_L$ - $W_R$ Mixing Angle $\zeta$

Lighter mass eigenstate  $W_1 = W_L \cos \zeta - W_R \sin \zeta$ . Light  $\nu_R$  assumed unless noted.  
 Values in brackets are from cosmological and astrophysical considerations.

VALUE	CL%	DOCUMENT ID	TECN	COMMENT
● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ●				
< 0.0333		21 BARENBOIM	97 RVUE	$\mu$ decay
< 0.04	90	22 MISHRA	92 CCFR	$\nu N$ scattering
-0.0006 to 0.0028	90	23 AQUINO	91 RVUE	
[none 0.00001-0.02]		24 BARBIERI	89B ASTR	SN 1987A
< 0.040	90	25 JODIDIO	86 ELEC	$\mu$ decay
-0.056 to 0.040	90	25 JODIDIO	86 ELEC	$\mu$ decay

<sup>21</sup> The quoted limit is from  $\mu$  decay parameters. BARENBOIM 97 also evaluate limit from  $K_L$ - $K_S$  mass difference.

<sup>22</sup> MISHRA 92 limit is from the absence of extra large- $x$ , large- $y$   $\bar{\nu}_\mu N \rightarrow \bar{\nu}_\mu X$  events at Tevatron, assuming left-handed  $\nu$  and right-handed  $\bar{\nu}$  in the neutrino beam. The result gives  $\zeta^2(1-2m_{W_1}^2/m_{W_2}^2) < 0.0015$ . The limit is independent of  $\nu_R$  mass.

<sup>23</sup> AQUINO 91 limits obtained from neutron lifetime and asymmetries together with unitarity of the CKM matrix. Manifest left-right asymmetry is assumed.

<sup>24</sup> BARBIERI 89B limit holds for  $m_{\nu_R} \leq 10$  MeV.

<sup>25</sup> First JODIDIO 86 result assumes  $m_{W_R} = \infty$ , second is for unconstrained  $m_{W_R}$ .

### A REVIEW GOES HERE – Check our WWW List of Reviews

### MASS LIMITS for $W'$ (A Heavy-Charged Vector Boson Other Than $W$ ) in Hadron Collider Experiments

Couplings of  $W'$  to quarks and leptons are taken to be identical with those of  $W$ . The following limits are obtained from  $p\bar{p} \rightarrow W'X$  with  $W'$  decaying to the mode indicated in the comments. New decay channels (e.g.,  $W' \rightarrow WZ$ ) are assumed to be suppressed. UA1 and UA2 experiments assume that the  $t\bar{b}$  channel is not open.

VALUE (GeV)	CL%	DOCUMENT ID	TECN	COMMENT
>720	95	26 ABACHI	96C D0	$W' \rightarrow e\nu_e$
● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ●				
none 300-420	95	27 ABE	97G CDF	$W' \rightarrow q\bar{q}$
>610	95	28 ABACHI	95E D0	$W' \rightarrow e\nu_e$ and $W' \rightarrow \tau\nu_\tau \rightarrow e\nu\nu\bar{\nu}$
>652	95	29 ABE	95M CDF	$W' \rightarrow e\nu_e$
>251	90	30 ALITTI	93 UA2	$W' \rightarrow q\bar{q}$
none 260-600	95	31 RIZZO	93 RVUE	$W' \rightarrow q\bar{q}$
>520	95	32 ABE	91F CDF	$W' \rightarrow e\nu, \mu\nu$
none 101-158	90	33 ALITTI	91 UA2	$W' \rightarrow q\bar{q}$
>220	90	34 ALBAJAR	89 UA1	$W' \rightarrow e\nu$
>209	90	35 ANSARI	87D UA2	$W' \rightarrow e\nu$
>210	90	36 ARNISON	86B UA1	$W' \rightarrow e\nu$
>170	90	37 ARNISON	83D UA1	$W' \rightarrow e\nu$

<sup>26</sup> For bounds on  $W_R$  with nonzero right-handed mass, see Fig. 5 from ABACHI 96C.

<sup>27</sup> ABE 97G search for new particle decaying to dijets.

- 28 ABACHI 95E assume that the decay  $W' \rightarrow WZ$  is suppressed and that the neutrino from  $W'$  decay is stable and has a mass significantly less  $m_{W'}$ .
- 29 ABE 95M assume that the decay  $W' \rightarrow WZ$  is suppressed and the (right-handed) neutrino is light, noninteracting, and stable. If  $m_{\nu}=60$  GeV, for example, the effect on the mass limit is negligible.
- 30 ALITTI 93 search for resonances in the two-jet invariant mass. The limit assumes  $\Gamma(W')/m_{W'} = \Gamma(W)/m_W$  and  $B(W' \rightarrow jj) = 2/3$ . This corresponds to  $W_R$  with  $m_{\nu_R} > m_{W_R}$  (no leptonic decay) and  $W_R \rightarrow t\bar{b}$  allowed. See their Fig. 4 for limits in the  $m_{W'}-B(q\bar{q})$  plane.
- 31 RIZZO 93 analyses CDF limit on possible two-jet resonances. The limit is sensitive to the inclusion of the assumed  $K$  factor.
- 32 ABE 91F assume leptonic branching ratio of 1/12 for each lepton flavor. The limit from the  $e\nu$  ( $\mu\nu$ ) mode alone is 490 (435) GeV. These limits apply to  $W_R$  if  $m_{\nu_R} \lesssim 15$  GeV and  $\nu_R$  does not decay in the detector. Cross section limit  $\sigma \cdot B < (1-10)$  pb is given for  $m_{W'} = 100-550$  GeV; see Fig. 2.
- 33 ALITTI 91 search is based on two-jet invariant mass spectrum, assuming  $B(W' \rightarrow q\bar{q}) = 67.6\%$ . Limit on  $\sigma \cdot B$  as a function of two-jet mass is given in Fig. 7.
- 34 ALBAJAR 89 cross section limit at 630 GeV is  $\sigma(W') B(e\nu) < 4.1$  pb (90% CL).
- 35 See Fig. 5 of ANSARI 87D for the excluded region in the  $m_{W'}-[(g_{W'q})^2 B(W' \rightarrow e\bar{\nu})]$  plane. Note that the quantity  $(g_{W'q})^2 B(W' \rightarrow e\bar{\nu})$  is normalized to unity for the standard  $W$  couplings.
- 36 ARNISON 86B find no excess at large  $p_T$  in 148  $W \rightarrow e\nu$  events. Set limit  $\sigma \times B(e\nu) < 10$  pb at CL = 90% at  $E_{cm} = 546$  and 630 GeV.
- 37 ARNISON 83D find among 47  $W \rightarrow e\nu$  candidates no event with excess  $p_T$ . Also set  $\sigma \times B(e\nu) < 30$  pb with CL = 90% at  $E_{cm} = 540$  GeV.

## MASS LIMITS for $Z'$ (Heavy Neutral Vector Boson Other Than $Z$ )

A REVIEW GOES HERE – Check our WWW List of Reviews

### Limits for $Z'_{SM}$

$Z'_{SM}$  is assumed to have couplings with quarks and leptons which are identical to those of  $Z$ .

VALUE (GeV)	CL%	DOCUMENT ID	TECN	COMMENT
>990	95	38 CVETIC	98 RVUE	Electroweak
>690	95	39 ABE	97S CDF	$p\bar{p}; Z'_{SM} \rightarrow e^+e^-, \mu^+\mu^-$
● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ●				
>490	95	ABACHI	96D D0	$p\bar{p}; Z'_{SM} \rightarrow e^+e^-$
>505	95	40 ABE	95 CDF	$p\bar{p}; Z'_{SM} \rightarrow e^+e^-$
>398	95	41 VILAIN	94B CHM2	$\nu_\mu e \rightarrow \nu_\mu e$ and $\bar{\nu}_\mu e \rightarrow \bar{\nu}_\mu e$
>237	90	42 ALITTI	93 UA2	$p\bar{p}; Z'_{SM} \rightarrow q\bar{q}$
>119	90	43 ALLEN	93 CALO	$\nu e \rightarrow \nu e$
none 490–560	95	44 RIZZO	93 RVUE	$p\bar{p}; Z'_{SM} \rightarrow q\bar{q}$
>412	95	ABE	92B CDF	$p\bar{p}; Z'_{SM} \rightarrow e^+e^-, \mu^+\mu^-$
>779	95	45,46 LANGACKER	92B RVUE	Repl. by CVETIC 98

>387	95	47 ABE	91D CDF	$p\bar{p}; Z'_{SM} \rightarrow e^+e^-$
>307	90	48 GEIREGAT	91 CHM2	$\nu_\mu e \rightarrow \nu_\mu e$ and $\bar{\nu}_\mu e \rightarrow \bar{\nu}_\mu e$
>426	90	49 ABE	90F VNS	$e^+e^-$
>208	90	50 HAGIWARA	90 RVUE	$e^+e^-$
>173	90	51 ALBAJAR	89 UA1	$p\bar{p}; Z'_{SM} \rightarrow e^+e^-$
>180	90	52 ANSARI	87D UA2	$p\bar{p}; Z'_{SM} \rightarrow e^+e^-$
>160	90	53 ARNISON	86B UA1	$p\bar{p}; Z_{SM} \rightarrow e^+e^-$

<sup>38</sup> CVETIC 98 give 95%CL limit on the  $Z$ - $Z'$  mixing  $-0.0023 < \theta < 0.0004$ .

<sup>39</sup> ABE 97S limit is obtained assuming that  $Z'$  decays to known fermions only.

<sup>40</sup> ABE 95 limit is obtained assuming that  $Z'$  decays to known fermions only.

<sup>41</sup> VILAIN 94B assume  $m_t = 150$  GeV.

<sup>42</sup> ALITTI 93 search for resonances in the two-jet invariant mass. The limit assumes  $B(Z' \rightarrow q\bar{q})=0.7$ . See their Fig. 5 for limits in the  $m_{Z'}-B(q\bar{q})$  plane.

<sup>43</sup> ALLEN 93 limit is from total cross section for  $\nu e \rightarrow \nu e$ , where  $\nu = \nu_e, \nu_\mu, \bar{\nu}_\mu$ .

<sup>44</sup> RIZZO 93 analyses CDF limit on possible two-jet resonances. The limit is sensitive to the inclusion of the assumed  $K$  factor.

<sup>45</sup> LANGACKER 92B fit to a wide range of electroweak data including LEP results available early '91.  $m_t > 89$  GeV used.

<sup>46</sup> LANGACKER 92B give 95%CL limits on the  $Z$ - $Z'$  mixing  $-0.0086 < \theta < 0.0005$ .

<sup>47</sup> ABE 91D give  $\sigma(Z') \cdot B(e^+e^-) < 1.31$  pb (95%CL) for  $m_{Z'} > 200$  GeV at  $E_{cm} = 1.8$  TeV. Limits ranging from 2 to 30 pb are given for  $m_{Z'} = 100-200$  GeV.

<sup>48</sup> GEIREGAT 91 limit is from comparison of  $g_V^e$  from  $\nu_\mu e$  scattering with  $\Gamma(Z \rightarrow ee)$  from LEP. Zero mixing assumed.

<sup>49</sup> ABE 90F use data for  $R, R_{\ell\ell}$ , and  $A_{\ell\ell}$ . They fix  $m_W = 80.49 \pm 0.43 \pm 0.24$  GeV and  $m_Z = 91.13 \pm 0.03$  GeV.

<sup>50</sup> HAGIWARA 90 perform a fit to  $e^+e^-$  data at PEP, PETRA, and TRISTAN including  $\mu^+\mu^-, \tau^+\tau^-$ , and hadron cross sections and asymmetries.

<sup>51</sup> ALBAJAR 89 cross section limit at 630 GeV is  $\sigma(Z') B(ee) < 4.2$  pb (90% CL).

<sup>52</sup> See Fig. 5 of ANSARI 87D for the excluded region in the  $m_{Z'}-[(g_{Z'q})^2 B(Z' \rightarrow e^+e^-)]$  plane. Note that the quantity  $(g_{Z'q})^2 B(Z' \rightarrow e^+e^-)$  is normalized to unity for the standard  $Z$  couplings.

<sup>53</sup> ARNISON 86B find no excess  $e^+e^-$  pairs among 13 pairs from  $Z$ . Set limit  $\sigma \times B(e^+e^-) < 13$  pb at CL = 90% at  $E_{cm} = 546$  and 630 GeV.

### Limits for $Z_{LR}$

$Z_{LR}$  is the extra neutral boson in left-right symmetric models.  $g_L = g_R$  is assumed unless noted. Values in parentheses assume stronger constraint on the Higgs sector, usually motivated by superstring models. Values in brackets are from cosmological and astrophysical considerations and assume a light right-handed neutrino.

VALUE (GeV)	CL%	DOCUMENT ID	TECN	COMMENT
>1700	68	54 BARENBOIM	98 RVUE	$Z$ parameters
> <b>390</b>	95	55 CVETIC	98 RVUE	Electroweak
> <b>630</b>	95	56 ABE	97S CDF	$p\bar{p}; Z'_{LR} \rightarrow e^+e^-, \mu^+\mu^-$

• • • We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. • • •

> 190	95	57 BARATE	97B ALEP	$e^+e^- \rightarrow \mu^+\mu^-$ and hadronic cross section
> 445	95	58 ABE	95 CDF	$\rho\bar{\rho}; Z'_{LR} \rightarrow e^+e^-$
> 253	95	59 VILAIN	94B CHM2	$\nu_\mu e \rightarrow \nu_\mu e$ and $\bar{\nu}_\mu e \rightarrow \bar{\nu}_\mu e$
> 130	95	60 ADRIANI	93D L3	Z parameters
(> 1500)	90	61 ALTARELLI	93B RVUE	Z parameters
none 490–560	95	62 RIZZO	93 RVUE	$\rho\bar{\rho}; Z'_{LR} \rightarrow q\bar{q}$
> 310	95	63 ABE	92B CDF	$\rho\bar{\rho}$
> 230	95	64 ABE	92B CDF	$\rho\bar{\rho}$
(> 900)	90	65 DELAGUILA	92 RVUE	
> 389	95	66,67 LANGACKER	92B RVUE	Repl. by CVETIC 98
(> 1400)		68 LAYSSAC	92B RVUE	Z parameters
(> 564)	90	69 POLAK	92 RVUE	$\mu$ decay
> 474	90	70 POLAK	92B RVUE	Electroweak
(> 1340)		71 RENTON	92 RVUE	
(> 800)	90	72 ALTARELLI	91B RVUE	Z parameters
(> 795)	90	73 DELAGUILA	91 RVUE	
> 382	90	74 POLAK	91 RVUE	Electroweak
[> 2000]		WALKER	91 COSM	Nucleosynthesis; light $\nu_R$
[> 500]		75 GRIFOLS	90 ASTR	SN 1987A; light $\nu_R$
(> 460)	90	76 HE	90B RVUE	
[> 2400–6800]		77 BARBIERI	89B ASTR	SN 1987A; light $\nu_R$
> 189		78 DELAGUILA	89 RVUE	$\rho\bar{\rho}$
[> 10000]		RAFFELT	88 ASTR	SN 1987A; light $\nu_R$
> 325	90	79 AMALDI	87 RVUE	
> 278	90	80 DURKIN	86 RVUE	
> 150	95	81 ADEVA	85B MRKJ	$e^+e^- \rightarrow \mu^+\mu^-$

<sup>54</sup> BARENBOIM 98 also gives 68% CL limits on the Z-Z' mixing  $-5.1 \times 10^{-4} < \theta < 3.3 \times 10^{-3}$ .

<sup>55</sup> CVETIC 98 give 95%CL limit on the Z-Z' mixing  $-0.0013 < \theta < 0.0021$ .

<sup>56</sup> ABE 97S limit is obtained assuming that Z' decays to known fermions only.

<sup>57</sup> BARATE 97B gives 95% CL limits on Z-Z' mixing  $-0.0017 < \theta < 0.0035$ . The bounds are computed with  $\alpha_s = 0.120 \pm 0.003$ ,  $m_t = 175 \pm 6$  GeV, and  $M_H = 150^{+120}_{-90}$  GeV. See their Fig. 4 for the limit contour in the mass-mixing plane.

<sup>58</sup> ABE 95 limit is obtained assuming that Z' decays to known fermions only. See their Fig. 3 for the mass bound of Z' decaying to all allowed fermions and supersymmetric fermions.

<sup>59</sup> VILAIN 94B assume  $m_t = 150$  GeV and  $\theta=0$ . See Fig. 2 for limit contours in the mass-mixing plane.

<sup>60</sup> ADRIANI 93D give limits on the Z-Z' mixing  $-0.002 < \theta < 0.015$  assuming the ABE 92B mass limit.

<sup>61</sup> ALTARELLI 93B limit is from LEP data available in summer '93 and is for  $m_t = 110$  GeV.  $m_H = 100$  GeV and  $\alpha_s = 0.118$  assumed. The limit improves for larger  $m_t$  (see their Fig. 5). The 90%CL limit on the Z-Z' mixing angle is in Table 4.

<sup>62</sup> RIZZO 93 analyses CDF limit on possible two-jet resonances. The limit is sensitive to the inclusion of the assumed K factor.

<sup>63</sup> These limits assume that Z' decays to known fermions only.

<sup>64</sup> These limits assume that Z' decays to all  $E_6$  fermions and their superpartners.

- <sup>65</sup> See Fig. 7b and 8 in DELAGUILA 92 for the allowed region in  $m_{Z'}$ -mixing plane and  $m_{Z'} - m_t$  plane from electroweak fit including '90 LEP data.
- <sup>66</sup> LANGACKER 92B fit to a wide range of electroweak data including LEP results available early '91.  $m_t > 89$  GeV used.
- <sup>67</sup> LANGACKER 92B give 95%CL limits on the  $Z$ - $Z'$  mixing  $-0.0025 < \theta < 0.0083$ .
- <sup>68</sup> LAYSSAC 92B limit is from LEP data available spring '92. Specific Higgs sector is assumed. See also LAYSSAC 92.
- <sup>69</sup> POLAK 92 limit is from  $m_{W_R} > 477$  GeV, which is derived from muon decay parameters assuming light  $\nu_R$ . Specific Higgs sector is assumed.
- <sup>70</sup> POLAK 92B limit is from a simultaneous fit to charged and neutral sector in  $SU(2)_L \times SU(2)_R \times U(1)$  model using  $Z$  parameters,  $m_W$ , and low-energy neutral current data as of 1991. Light  $\nu_R$  assumed and  $m_t = m_H = 100$  GeV used. Supersedes POLAK 91.
- <sup>71</sup> RENTON 92 limits use LEP data taken up to '90 as well as  $m_W$ ,  $\nu N$ , and atomic parity violation data. Specific Higgs structure is assumed.
- <sup>72</sup> ALTARELLI 91B is based on  $Z$  mass, widths, and  $A_{FB}$ . The limits are for superstring motivated models with extra assumption on the Higgs sector.  $m_t > 90$  GeV and  $m_{H^0} < 1$  TeV assumed. For large  $m_t$ , the bound improves drastically. Bounds for  $Z$ - $Z'$  mixing angle and  $Z$  mass shift without this model assumption are also given in the paper.
- <sup>73</sup> DELAGUILA 91 bounds have extra assumption of superstring motivated Higgs sector. From  $\nu N$  neutral current data with  $m_Z = 91.10 \pm 0.04$  GeV,  $m_t > 77$  GeV,  $m_{H^0} < 1$  TeV assumed.
- <sup>74</sup> POLAK 91 limit is from a simultaneous fit to charged and neutral sector in  $SU(2)_L \times SU(2)_R \times U(1)$  model using  $m_W$ ,  $m_Z$ , and low-energy neutral current data as of 1990. Light  $\nu_R$  assumed and  $m_t = m_H = 100$  GeV used. Superseded by POLAK 92B.
- <sup>75</sup> GRIFOLS 90 limit holds for  $m_{\nu_R} \lesssim 1$  MeV. See also GRIFOLS 90D, RIZZO 91.
- <sup>76</sup> HE 90B model assumes a specific Higgs sector. Neutral current data of COSTA 88 as well as  $m_Z$  is used.  $g_R$  is left free in the fit.
- <sup>77</sup> BARBIERI 89B limit holds for  $m_{\nu_R} \leq 10$  MeV.
- <sup>78</sup> DELAGUILA 89 limit is based on  $\sigma(p\bar{p} \rightarrow Z') \cdot B(Z' \rightarrow e^+ e^-) < 1.8$  pb at CERN  $p\bar{p}$  collider.
- <sup>79</sup> A wide range of neutral current data as of 1986 are used in the fit.
- <sup>80</sup> A wide range of neutral current data as of 1985 are used in the fit.
- <sup>81</sup> ADEVA 85B measure asymmetry of  $\mu$ -pair production, following formalism of RIZZO 81.

### Limits for $Z_\chi$

$Z_\chi$  is the extra neutral boson in  $SO(10) \rightarrow SU(5) \times U(1)_\chi$ .  $g_\chi = e/\cos\theta_W$  is assumed unless otherwise stated. We list limits with the assumption  $\rho = 1$  but with no further constraints on the Higgs sector. Values in parentheses assume stronger constraint on the Higgs sector motivated by superstring models. Values in brackets are from cosmological and astrophysical considerations and assume a light right-handed neutrino.

VALUE (GeV)	CL%	DOCUMENT ID	TECN	COMMENT
<b>&gt;451</b>	95	82 CHO	98B RVUE	Electroweak
<b>&gt;595</b>	95	83 ABE	97S CDF	$p\bar{p}; Z'_\chi \rightarrow e^+ e^-, \mu^+ \mu^-$

• • • We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. • • •

>470	95	84 CHO	98 RVUE	
>330	95	85 CVETIC	98 RVUE	Electroweak
>190	95	86 ARIMA	97 VNS	Bhabha scattering
>236	95	87 BARATE	97B ALEP	$e^+e^- \rightarrow \mu^+\mu^-$ and hadronic cross section
>196	95	88 BUSKULIC	96N ALEP	Hadronic cross section
>425	95	89 ABE	95 CDF	$\rho\bar{p}; Z' \rightarrow e^+e^-$
>147	95	90 ABREU	95M DLPH	Z parameters and $e^+e^- \rightarrow \mu^+\mu^- (n\gamma)$
		91 NARDI	95 RVUE	Z parameters
		92 BUSKULIC	94 ALEP	Z parameters
>262	95	93 VILAIN	94B CHM2	$\nu_\mu e \rightarrow \nu_\mu e$ and $\bar{\nu}_\mu e \rightarrow \bar{\nu}_\mu e$
>117	95	94 ADRIANI	93D L3	Z parameters
(>900)	90	95 ALTARELLI	93B RVUE	Z parameters
>340	95	96 ABE	92B CDF	$\rho\bar{p}$
>280	95	97 ABE	92B CDF	$\rho\bar{p}$
(>650)	90	98 DELAGUILA	92 RVUE	
>321	95	99,100 LANGACKER	92B RVUE	Repl. by CVETIC 98
(>760)		101 LAYSSAC	92B RVUE	Z parameters
>148	95	102 LEIKE	92 RVUE	Z parameters
(>700)		103 RENTON	92 RVUE	
(> 500)	90	104 ALTARELLI	91B RVUE	Z parameters
(> 570)		105 BUCHMUEL...	91 RVUE	Z parameters
(> 555)	90	106 DELAGUILA	91 RVUE	
[>1470]		107 FARAGGI	91 COSM	Nucleosynthesis; light $\nu_R$
>320	90	108 GONZALEZ-G.	91 RVUE	
>221		109 MAHANTHAP.	91 RVUE	Cs
>231	90	110,111 ABE	90F VNS	$e^+e^-$
>206	90	111,112 ABE	90F RVUE	$e^+e^-, \nu_\mu e$
>335		113 BARGER	90B RVUE	$\rho\bar{p}$
(> 650)	90	114 GLASHOW	90 RVUE	
[> 1140]		115 GONZALEZ-G.	90D COSM	Nucleosynthesis; light $\nu_R$
[> 2100]		116 GRIFOLS	90 ASTR	SN 1987A; light $\nu_R$
none <150 or > 363	90	117 HAGIWARA	90 RVUE	$e^+e^-$
>177		118 DELAGUILA	89 RVUE	$\rho\bar{p}$
>280	95	119 DORENBOS...	89 CHRM	$g_\chi = g_Z$
>352	90	120 COSTA	88 RVUE	
>170	90	121 ELLIS	88 RVUE	$\rho\bar{p}$
>273	90	120 AMALDI	87 RVUE	
>266	90	122 MARCIANO	87 RVUE	
>283	90	123 DURKIN	86 RVUE	

<sup>82</sup> CHO 98B use various electroweak data to constrain  $Z'$  models. See their Eq. (4.8) for their fit in mass-mixing plane.

<sup>83</sup> ABE 97S limit is obtained assuming that  $Z'$  decays to known fermions only.

<sup>84</sup> CHO 98 limit is from constraints on four-Fermi contact interactions obtained from low-energy electroweak experiments.

<sup>85</sup> CVETIC 98 give 95%CL limit on the  $Z$ - $Z'$  mixing  $-0.0029 < \theta < 0.0011$ .

<sup>86</sup>  $Z$ - $Z'$  mixing is assumed to be zero.

- 87 BARATE 97B gives 95% CL limits on  $Z$ - $Z'$  mixing  $-0.0016 < \theta < 0.0036$ . The bounds are computed with  $\alpha_s = 0.120 \pm 0.003$ ,  $m_t = 175 \pm 6$  GeV, and  $M_H = 150_{-90}^{+120}$  GeV. See their Fig. 4 for the limit contour in the mass-mixing plane.
- 88 BUSKULIC 96N limit is from a combined fit to the hadronic cross sections measured at  $\sqrt{s}=130, 136$  GeV (ALEPH) and  $\sqrt{s}=58$  GeV (TOPAZ). Zero mixing is assumed.
- 89 ABE 95 limit is obtained assuming that  $Z'$  decays to known fermions only. See their Fig. 3 for the mass bound of  $Z'$  decaying to all allowed fermions and supersymmetric fermions.
- 90 ABREU 95M limit is for  $\alpha_s=0.123$ ,  $m_t=150$  GeV, and  $m_H=300$  GeV. For the limit contour in the mass-mixing plane, see their Fig. 13.
- 91 NARDI 95 give 90%CL limits on  $Z$ - $Z'$  mixing  $-0.0032 < \theta < 0.0031$  for  $M_{Z'} > 500$  GeV,  $m_t=170$  GeV,  $m_H=250$  GeV,  $\alpha_s=0.12$ . The bound is relaxed under the simultaneous presence of the mixing of the known fermions with new heavy states,  $-0.0032 < \theta < 0.0079$ .
- 92 BUSKULIC 94 give 95%CL limits on the  $Z$ - $Z'$  mixing  $-0.0091 < \theta < 0.0023$ .
- 93 VILAIN 94B assume  $m_t = 150$  GeV and  $\theta=0$ . See Fig.2 for limit contours in the mass-mixing plane.
- 94 ADRIANI 93D give limits on the  $Z$ - $Z'$  mixing  $-0.004 < \theta < 0.015$  assuming the ABE 92B mass limit.
- 95 ALTARELLI 93B limit is from LEP data available in summer '93 and is for  $m_t = 110$  GeV.  $m_H = 100$  GeV and  $\alpha_s = 0.118$  assumed. The limit improves for larger  $m_t$  (see their Fig. 5). The 90%CL limit on the  $Z$ - $Z'$  mixing angle is in their Fig. 2.
- 96 These limits assume that  $Z'$  decays to known fermions only.
- 97 These limits assume that  $Z'$  decays to all  $E_6$  fermions and their superpartners.
- 98 See Fig. 7a and 8 in DELAGUILA 92 for the allowed region in  $m_{Z'}$ -mixing plane and  $m_{Z'} - m_t$  plane from electroweak fit including '90 LEP data.
- 99 LANGACKER 92B fit to a wide range of electroweak data including LEP results available early '91.  $m_t > 89$  GeV used.
- 100 LANGACKER 92B give 95%CL limits on the  $Z$ - $Z'$  mixing  $-0.0048 < \theta < 0.0097$ .
- 101 LAYSSAC 92B limit is from LEP data available spring '92. Specific Higgs sector is assumed. See also LAYSSAC 92.
- 102 LEIKE 92 is based on '90 LEP data published in LEP 92.
- 103 RENTON 92 limits use LEP data taken up to '90 as well as  $m_W$ ,  $\nu N$ , and atomic parity violation data. Specific Higgs structure is assumed.
- 104 ALTARELLI 91B is based on  $Z$  mass, widths, and  $A_{FB}$ . The limits are for superstring motivated models with extra assumption on the Higgs sector.  $m_t > 90$  GeV and  $m_{H^0} < 1$  TeV assumed. For large  $m_t$ , the bound improves drastically. Bounds for  $Z$ - $Z'$  mixing angle and  $Z$  mass shift without this model assumption are also given in the paper.
- 105 BUCHMUELLER 91 limit is from LEP data. Specific assumption is made for the Higgs sector.
- 106 DELAGUILA 91 bounds have extra assumption of superstring motivated Higgs sector. From  $\nu N$  neutral current data with  $m_Z = 91.10 \pm 0.04$  GeV,  $m_t > 77$  GeV,  $m_{H^0} < 1$  TeV assumed.
- 107 FARAGGI 91 limit assumes the nucleosynthesis bound on the effective number of neutrinos  $\Delta N_\nu < 0.5$  and is valid for  $m_{\nu_R} < 1$  MeV.
- 108 GONZALEZ-GARCIA 91 limit is based on low-energy neutral current data,  $Z$  mass and widths,  $m_W$  from ABE 90G.  $100 < m_t < 200$  GeV,  $m_{H^0} = 100$  GeV assumed. Dependence on  $m_t$  is shown in Fig. 7.
- 109 MAHANTHAPPA 91 limit is from atomic parity violation in Cs with  $m_W$ ,  $m_Z$ .
- 110 ABE 90F use data for  $R$ ,  $R_{\ell\ell}$ , and  $A_{\ell\ell}$ .
- 111 ABE 90F fix  $m_W = 80.49 \pm 0.43 \pm 0.24$  GeV and  $m_Z = 91.13 \pm 0.03$  GeV.

- 112  $e^+e^-$  data for  $R$ ,  $R_{\ell\ell}$ ,  $A_{\ell\ell}$ , and  $A_{c\bar{c}}$  below  $Z$  as well as  $\nu_\mu e$  scattering data of GEIREGAT 89 is used in the fit.
- 113 BARGER 90B limit is based on CDF limit  $\sigma(p\bar{p} \rightarrow Z') \cdot B(Z' \rightarrow e^+e^-) < 1$  pb (Nodulman, EPS Conf. '89). Assumes no new threshold is open for  $Z'$  decay.
- 114 GLASHOW 90 model assumes a specific Higgs sector. See GLASHOW 90B.
- 115 These authors claim that the nucleosynthesis bound on the effective number of light neutrinos ( $\delta N_\nu < 1$ ) constrains  $Z'$  masses if  $\nu_R$  is light ( $\lesssim 1$  MeV).
- 116 GRIFOLS 90 limit holds for  $m_{\nu_R} \lesssim 1$  MeV. See also GRIFOLS 90D, RIZZO 91.
- 117 HAGIWARA 90 perform a fit to  $e^+e^-$  data at PEP, PETRA, and TRISTAN including  $\mu^+\mu^-$ ,  $\tau^+\tau^-$ , and hadron cross sections and asymmetries. The upper mass limit disappears at 2.7 s.d.
- 118 DELAGUILA 89 limit is based on  $\sigma(p\bar{p} \rightarrow Z') \cdot B(Z' \rightarrow e^+e^-) < 1.8$  pb at CERN  $p\bar{p}$  collider.
- 119 DORENBOSCH 89 obtain the limit  $(g_\chi/g_Z)^2 \cdot (m_Z/m_{Z_\chi})^2 < 0.11$  at 95% CL from the processes  $\bar{\nu}_\mu e \rightarrow \bar{\nu}_\mu e$  and  $\nu_\mu e \rightarrow \nu_\mu e$ .
- 120 A wide range of neutral current data as of 1986 are used in the fit.
- 121  $Z'$  mass limits from non-observation of an excess of  $\ell^+\ell^-$  pairs at the CERN  $p\bar{p}$  collider [based on ANSARI 87D and GEER Uppsala Conf. 87]. The limits apply when  $Z'$  decays only into light quarks and leptons.
- 122 MARCIANO 87 limit from unitarity of Cabibbo-Kobayashi-Maskawa matrix.
- 123 A wide range of neutral current data as of 1985 are used in the fit.

### Limits for $Z_\psi$

$Z_\psi$  is the extra neutral boson in  $E_6 \rightarrow SO(10) \times U(1)_\psi$ .  $g_\psi = e/\cos\theta_W$  is assumed unless otherwise stated. We list limits with the assumption  $\rho = 1$  but with no further constraints on the Higgs sector. Values in brackets are from cosmological and astrophysical considerations and assume a light right-handed neutrino.

VALUE (GeV)	CL%	DOCUMENT ID	TECN	COMMENT
>170	95	124 CVETIC	98 RVUE	Electroweak
>590	95	125 ABE	97S CDF	$p\bar{p}$ ; $Z'_\psi \rightarrow e^+e^-, \mu^+\mu^-$
● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ●				
>140	95	126 CHO	98 RVUE	
>136	95	127 CHO	98B RVUE	Electroweak
>160	95	128 BARATE	97B ALEP	$e^+e^- \rightarrow \mu^+\mu^-$ and hadronic cross section
>148	95	129 BUSKULIC	96N ALEP	Hadronic cross section
>415	95	130 ABE	95 CDF	$p\bar{p}$ ; $Z'_\psi \rightarrow e^+e^-$
>105	95	131 ABREU	95M DLPH	$Z$ parameters and $e^+e^- \rightarrow \mu^+\mu^- (n\gamma)$
		132 NARDI	95 RVUE	$Z$ parameters
>135	95	133 VILAIN	94B CHM2	$\nu_\mu e \rightarrow \nu_\mu e$ and $\bar{\nu}_\mu e \rightarrow \bar{\nu}_\mu e$
>118	95	134 ADRIANI	93D L3	$Z$ parameters
>320	95	135 ABE	92B CDF	$p\bar{p}$
>180	95	136 ABE	92B CDF	$p\bar{p}$

- |          |    |         |             |     |      |                                |
|----------|----|---------|-------------|-----|------|--------------------------------|
| >160     | 95 | 137,138 | LANGACKER   | 92B | RVUE | Repl. by CVETIC 98             |
| >122     | 95 | 139     | LEIKE       | 92  | RVUE | Z parameters                   |
| >105     | 90 | 140,141 | ABE         | 90F | VNS  | $e^+e^-$                       |
| >146     | 90 | 141,142 | ABE         | 90F | RVUE | $e^+e^-$ , $\nu_\mu e$         |
| >320     |    | 143     | BARGER      | 90B | RVUE | $p\bar{p}$                     |
| [> 160]  |    | 144     | GONZALEZ-G. | 90D | COSM | Nucleosynthesis; light $\nu_R$ |
| [> 2000] |    | 145     | GRIFOLS     | 90D | ASTR | SN 1987A; light $\nu_R$        |
| >136     | 90 | 146     | HAGIWARA    | 90  | RVUE | $e^+e^-$                       |
| >154     | 90 | 147     | AMALDI      | 87  | RVUE |                                |
| >146     | 90 | 148     | DURKIN      | 86  | RVUE |                                |
- 124 CVETIC 98 give 95%CL limit on the  $Z$ - $Z'$  mixing  $-0.0022 < \theta < 0.0026$ .
- 125 ABE 97S limit is obtained assuming that  $Z'$  decays to known fermions only.
- 126 CHO 98 limit is from constraints on four-Fermi contact interactions obtained from low-energy electroweak experiments.
- 127 CHO 98B use various electroweak data to constrain  $Z'$  models. See their Eq. (4.9) for their fit in mass-mixing plane.
- 128 BARATE 97B gives 95% CL limits on  $Z$ - $Z'$  mixing  $-0.0020 < \theta < 0.0038$ . The bounds are computed with  $\alpha_s = 0.120 \pm 0.003$ ,  $m_t = 175 \pm 6$  GeV, and  $M_H = 150^{+120}_{-90}$  GeV. See their Fig. 4 for the limit contour in the mass-mixing plane.
- 129 BUSKULIC 96N limit is from a combined fit to the hadronic cross sections measured at  $\sqrt{s}=130, 136$  GeV (ALEPH) and  $\sqrt{s}=58$  GeV (TOPAZ). Zero mixing is assumed.
- 130 ABE 95 limit is obtained assuming that  $Z'$  decays to known fermions only. See their Fig. 3 for the mass bound of  $Z'$  decaying to all allowed fermions and supersymmetric fermions.
- 131 ABREU 95M limit is for  $\alpha_s=0.123$ ,  $m_t=150$  GeV, and  $m_H=300$  GeV. For the limit contour in the mass-mixing plane, see their Fig. 13.
- 132 NARDI 95 give 90%CL limits on  $Z$ - $Z'$  mixing  $-0.0056 < \theta < 0.0055$  for  $M_{Z'} > 500$  GeV,  $m_t=170$  GeV,  $m_H=250$  GeV,  $\alpha_s=0.12$ . The bound is relaxed under the simultaneous presence of the mixing of the known fermions with new heavy states,  $-0.0066 < \theta < 0.0071$ .
- 133 VILAIN 94B assume  $m_t = 150$  GeV and  $\theta=0$ . See Fig. 2 for limit contours in the mass-mixing plane.
- 134 ADRIANI 93D give limits on the  $Z$ - $Z'$  mixing  $-0.003 < \theta < 0.020$  assuming the ABE 92B mass limit.
- 135 These limits assume that  $Z'$  decays to known fermions only.
- 136 These limits assume that  $Z'$  decays to all  $E_6$  fermions and their superpartners.
- 137 LANGACKER 92B fit to a wide range of electroweak data including LEP results available early '91.  $m_t > 89$  GeV used.
- 138 LANGACKER 92B give 95%CL limits on the  $Z$ - $Z'$  mixing  $-0.0025 < \theta < 0.013$ .
- 139 LEIKE 92 is based on '90 LEP data published in LEP 92.
- 140 ABE 90F use data for  $R$ ,  $R_{\ell\ell}$ , and  $A_{\ell\ell}$ .
- 141 ABE 90F fix  $m_W = 80.49 \pm 0.43 \pm 0.24$  GeV and  $m_Z = 91.13 \pm 0.03$  GeV.
- 142  $e^+e^-$  data for  $R$ ,  $R_{\ell\ell}$ ,  $A_{\ell\ell}$ , and  $A_{C\bar{C}}$  below  $Z$  as well as  $\nu_\mu e$  scattering data of GEIREGAT 89 is used in the fit.
- 143 BARGER 90B limit is based on CDF limit  $\sigma(p\bar{p} \rightarrow Z') \cdot B(Z' \rightarrow e^+e^-) < 1$  pb (Nodulman, EPS Conf. '89). Assumes no new threshold is open for  $Z'$  decay.
- 144 These authors claim that the nucleosynthesis bound on the effective number of light neutrinos ( $\delta N_\nu < 1$ ) constrains  $Z'$  masses if  $\nu_R$  is light ( $\lesssim 1$  MeV).
- 145 GRIFOLS 90D limit holds for  $m_{\nu_R} \lesssim 1$  MeV. See also RIZZO 91.
- 146 HAGIWARA 90 perform a fit to  $e^+e^-$  data at PEP, PETRA, and TRISTAN including  $\mu^+\mu^-$ ,  $\tau^+\tau^-$ , and hadron cross sections and asymmetries.
- 147 A wide range of neutral current data as of 1986 are used in the fit.
- 148 A wide range of neutral current data as of 1985 are used in the fit.

## Limits for $Z_\eta$

$Z_\eta$  is the extra neutral boson in  $E_6$  models, corresponding to  $Q_\eta = \sqrt{3/8} Q_\chi - \sqrt{5/8} Q_\psi$ .  $g_\eta = e/\cos\theta_W$  is assumed unless otherwise stated. We list limits with the assumption  $\rho=1$  but with no further constraints on the Higgs sector. Values in parentheses assume stronger constraint on the Higgs sector motivated by superstring models. Values in brackets are from cosmological and astrophysical considerations and assume a light right-handed neutrino.

VALUE (GeV)	CL%	DOCUMENT ID	TECN	COMMENT
<b>&gt;317</b>	95	149 CHO	98B RVUE	Electroweak
<b>&gt;620</b>	95	150 ABE	97S CDF	$p\bar{p}; Z'_\eta \rightarrow e^+ e^-, \mu^+ \mu^-$
● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ●				
>340	95	151 CHO	98 RVUE	
>220	95	152 CVETIC	98 RVUE	Electroweak
>173	95	153 BARATE	97B ALEP	$e^+ e^- \rightarrow \mu^+ \mu^-$ and hadronic cross section
>167	95	154 BUSKULIC	96N ALEP	Hadronic cross section
>440	95	155 ABE	95 CDF	$p\bar{p}; Z'_\eta \rightarrow e^+ e^-$
>109	95	156 ABREU	95M DLPH	Z parameters and $e^+ e^- \rightarrow \mu^+ \mu^- (n\gamma)$
		157 NARDI	95 RVUE	Z parameters
>100	95	158 VILAIN	94B CHM2	$\nu_\mu e \rightarrow \nu_\mu e$ and $\bar{\nu}_\mu e \rightarrow \bar{\nu}_\mu e$
>100	95	159 ADRIANI	93D L3	Z parameters
(>500)	90	160 ALTARELLI	93B RVUE	Z parameters
>340	95	161 ABE	92B CDF	$p\bar{p}$
>230	95	162 ABE	92B CDF	$p\bar{p}$
(>450)	90	163 DELAGUILA	92 RVUE	
>182	95	164,165 LANGACKER	92B RVUE	Repl. by CVETIC 98
(>315)		166 LAYSSAC	92B RVUE	Z parameters
>118	95	167 LEIKE	92 RVUE	Z parameters
(>470)		168 RENTON	92 RVUE	
(> 300)	90	169 ALTARELLI	91B RVUE	Z parameters
>120	90	170 GONZALEZ-G.	91 RVUE	
>125	90	171,172 ABE	90F VNS	$e^+ e^-$
>115	90	172,173 ABE	90F RVUE	$e^+ e^-, \nu_\mu e$
>340		174 BARGER	90B RVUE	$p\bar{p}$
[> 820]		175 GONZALEZ-G.	90D COSM	Nucleosynthesis; light $\nu_R$
[> 3300]		176 GRIFOLS	90 ASTR	SN 1987A; light $\nu_R$
>100	90	177 HAGIWARA	90 RVUE	$e^+ e^-$
[> 1040]		175 LOPEZ	90 COSM	Nucleosynthesis; light $\nu_R$
>173		178 DELAGUILA	89 RVUE	$p\bar{p}$
>129	90	179 COSTA	88 RVUE	
>156	90	180 ELLIS	88 RVUE	
>167	90	181 ELLIS	88 RVUE	$p\bar{p}$
>111	90	179 AMALDI	87 RVUE	
>143	90	182 BARGER	86B RVUE	$p\bar{p}$
>130	90	183 DURKIN	86 RVUE	
[> 760]		175 ELLIS	86 COSM	Nucleosynthesis; light $\nu_R$
[> 500]		175 STEIGMAN	86 COSM	Nucleosynthesis; light $\nu_R$

- 149 CHO 98B use various electroweak data to constrain  $Z'$  models. See their Eq. (4.10) for their fit in mass-mixing plane.
- 150 ABE 97S limit is obtained assuming that  $Z'$  decays to known fermions only.
- 151 CHO 98 limit is from constraints on four-Fermi contact interactions obtained from low-energy electroweak experiments.
- 152 CVETIC 98 give 95%CL limit on the  $Z$ - $Z'$  mixing  $-0.0055 < \theta < 0.0021$ .
- 153 BARATE 97B gives 95% CL limits on  $Z$ - $Z'$  mixing  $-0.021 < \theta < 0.012$ . The bounds are computed with  $\alpha_s = 0.120 \pm 0.003$ ,  $m_t = 175 \pm 6$  GeV, and  $M_H = 150_{-90}^{+120}$  GeV. See their Fig. 4 for the limit contour in the mass-mixing plane.
- 154 BUSKULIC 96N limit is from a combined fit to the hadronic cross sections measured at  $\sqrt{s}=130, 136$  GeV (ALEPH) and  $\sqrt{s}=58$  GeV (TOPAZ). Zero mixing is assumed.
- 155 ABE 95 limit is obtained assuming that  $Z'$  decays to known fermions only. See their Fig. 3 for the mass bound of  $Z'$  decaying to all allowed fermions and supersymmetric fermions.
- 156 ABREU 95M limit is for  $\alpha_s=0.123$ ,  $m_t=150$  GeV, and  $m_H=300$  GeV. For the limit contour in the mass-mixing plane, see their Fig. 13.
- 157 NARDI 95 give 90%CL limits on  $Z$ - $Z'$  mixing  $-0.0087 < \theta < 0.0075$  for  $M_{Z'} > 500$  GeV,  $m_t=170$  GeV,  $m_H=250$  GeV,  $\alpha_s=0.12$ . The bound is relaxed under the simultaneous presence of the mixing of the known fermions with new heavy states,  $-0.0087 < \theta < 0.010$ .
- 158 VILAIN 94B assume  $m_t = 150$  GeV and  $\theta=0$ . See Fig. 2 for limit contours in the mass-mixing plane.
- 159 ADRIANI 93D give limits on the  $Z$ - $Z'$  mixing  $-0.029 < \theta < 0.010$  assuming the ABE 92B mass limit.
- 160 ALTARELLI 93B limit is from LEP data available in summer '93 and is for  $m_t = 110$  GeV.  $m_H = 100$  GeV and  $\alpha_s = 0.118$  assumed. The 90%CL limit on the  $Z$ - $Z'$  mixing angle is in Fig. 2.
- 161 These limits assume that  $Z'$  decays to known fermions only.
- 162 These limits assume that  $Z'$  decays to all  $E_6$  fermions and their superpartners.
- 163 See Fig. 7d in DELAGUILA 92 for the allowed region in  $m_{Z'}$ -mixing plane from electroweak fit including '90 LEP data.
- 164 LANGACKER 92B fit to a wide range of electroweak data including LEP results available early '91.  $m_t > 89$  GeV used.
- 165 LANGACKER 92B give 95%CL limits on the  $Z$ - $Z'$  mixing  $-0.038 < \theta < 0.002$ .
- 166 LAYSSAC 92B limit is from LEP data available spring '92. Specific Higgs sector is assumed. See also LAYSSAC 92.
- 167 LEIKE 92 is based on '90 LEP data published in LEP 92.
- 168 RENTON 92 limits use LEP data taken up to '90 as well as  $m_W$ ,  $\nu N$ , and atomic parity violation data. Specific Higgs structure is assumed.
- 169 ALTARELLI 91B is based on  $Z$  mass, widths, and  $A_{FB}$ . The limits are for superstring motivated models with extra assumption on the Higgs sector.  $m_t > 90$  GeV and  $m_{H^0} < 1$  TeV assumed. For large  $m_t$ , the bound improves drastically. Bounds for  $Z$ - $Z'$  mixing angle and  $Z$  mass shift without this model assumption are also given in the paper.
- 170 GONZALEZ-GARCIA 91 limit is based on low-energy neutral current data, LEP  $Z$  mass and widths,  $m_W$  from ABE 90G.  $100 < m_t < 200$  GeV,  $m_{H^0} = 100$  GeV assumed. Dependence on  $m_t$  is shown in Fig. 8.
- 171 ABE 90F use data for  $R$ ,  $R_{\ell\ell}$ , and  $A_{\ell\ell}$ .
- 172 ABE 90F fix  $m_W = 80.49 \pm 0.43 \pm 0.24$  GeV and  $m_Z = 91.13 \pm 0.03$  GeV.
- 173  $e^+e^-$  data for  $R$ ,  $R_{\ell\ell}$ ,  $A_{\ell\ell}$ , and  $A_{C\bar{C}}$  below  $Z$  as well as  $\nu_\mu e$  scattering data of GEIREGAT 89 is used in the fit.
- 174 BARGER 90B limit is based on CDF limit  $\sigma(p\bar{p} \rightarrow Z') \cdot B(Z' \rightarrow e^+e^-) < 1$  pb (Nodulman, EPS Conf. '89). Assumes no new threshold is open for  $Z'$  decay.

- 175 These authors claim that the nucleosynthesis bound on the effective number of light neutrinos ( $\delta N_\nu < 1$ ) constrains  $Z'$  masses if  $\nu_R$  is light ( $\lesssim 1$  MeV).
- 176 GRIFOLS 90 limit holds for  $m_{\nu_R} \lesssim 1$  MeV. See also GRIFOLS 90D, RIZZO 91.
- 177 HAGIWARA 90 perform a fit to  $e^+e^-$  data at PEP, PETRA, and TRISTAN including  $\mu^+\mu^-$ ,  $\tau^+\tau^-$ , and hadron cross sections and asymmetries.
- 178 DELAGUILA 89 limit is based on  $\sigma(p\bar{p} \rightarrow Z') \cdot B(Z' \rightarrow e^+e^-) < 1.8$  pb at CERN  $p\bar{p}$  collider.
- 179 A wide range of neutral current data as of 1986 are used in the fit.
- 180  $Z_\eta$  mass limits obtained by combining constraints from non-observation of an excess of  $\ell^+\ell^-$  pairs at the CERN  $p\bar{p}$  collider and the global analysis of neutral current data by COSTA 88. Least favorable spectrum of three ( $E_6$  27) generations of particles and their superpartners are assumed.
- 181  $Z'$  mass limits from non-observation of an excess of  $\ell^+\ell^-$  pairs at the CERN  $p\bar{p}$  collider [based on ANSARI 87D and GEER Uppsala Conf. 87]. The limits apply when  $Z'$  decays only into light quarks and leptons.
- 182 BARGER 86B limit is based on UA1/UA2 limit on  $p\bar{p} \rightarrow Z'$ ,  $Z' \rightarrow e^+e^-$  (Lepton Photon Symp., Kyoto, '85). Extra decay channels for  $Z'$  are assumed not be open.
- 183 A wide range of neutral current data as of 1985 are used in the fit.

### Limits for other $Z'$

$$Z_\beta = Z_\chi \cos\beta + Z_\psi \sin\beta$$

VALUE (GeV)	CL%	DOCUMENT ID	TECN	COMMENT
● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ●				
>290	95	184 CHO	98 RVUE	$Z_\beta$ with $\tan\beta = \sqrt{15}$
>284	95	185 CHO	98B RVUE	$\tan\beta = \sqrt{15}$
		186 DELAGUILA	92 RVUE	
>360		187 ALTARELLI	91 RVUE	$Z_\beta$ with $\tan\beta = \sqrt{3/5}$ ;
				Cs
>190		188 MAHANTHAPPA.91	RVUE	$Z_\beta$ with $\tan\beta = \sqrt{3/5}$ ;
				Cs
		189 GRIFOLS	90C RVUE	
		190 DELAGUILA	89 RVUE	$p\bar{p}$
>180	90	191,192 COSTA	88 RVUE	$Z_\beta$ with $\tan\beta = \sqrt{15}$
>158	90	193 ELLIS	88 RVUE	$Z_\beta$ ( $\tan\beta = \sqrt{15}$ ), $p\bar{p}$

- 184 CHO 98 limit is from constraints on four-Fermi contact interactions obtained from low-energy electroweak experiments.
- 185 CHO 98B use various electroweak data to constrain  $Z'$  models. See their Eq. (4.11) for their fit in mass-mixing plane.
- 186 Fig. 7c and 7e in DELAGUILA 92 give limits for  $\tan\beta = -1/\sqrt{15}$  and  $\sqrt{15}$  from electroweak fit including '90 LEP data.
- 187 ALTARELLI 91 limit is from atomic parity violation in Cs together with LEP, CDF data.  $Z-Z'$  mixing is assumed to be zero to set the limit.
- 188 MAHANTHAPPA 91 limit is from atomic parity violation in Cs with  $m_W$ ,  $m_Z$ . See Table III of MAHANTHAPPA 91 (corrected in erratum) for limits on various  $Z'$  models.
- 189 GRIFOLS 90C obtains a limit for  $Z'$  mass as a function of mixing angle  $\beta$  (his  $\theta = \beta - \pi/2$ ), which is derived from a LAMPF experiment on  $\sigma(\nu_e e)$  (ALLEN 90). The result is shown in Fig. 1.
- 190 See Table I of DELAGUILA 89 for limits on various  $Z'$  models.
- 191  $g_\beta = e/\cos\theta_W$  and  $\rho = 1$  assumed.
- 192 A wide range of neutral current data as of 1986 are used in the fit.

<sup>193</sup>  $Z'$  mass limits from non-observation of an excess of  $\ell^+ \ell^-$  pairs at the CERN  $p\bar{p}$  collider [based on ANSARI 87D and GEER Uppsala Conf. 87]. The limits apply when  $Z'$  decays only into light quarks and leptons.

## A REVIEW GOES HERE – Check our WWW List of Reviews

### MASS LIMITS for Leptoquarks from Pair Production

These limits rely only on the color or electroweak charge of the leptoquark.

VALUE (GeV)	CL%	EVTS	DOCUMENT ID	TECN	COMMENT
>225	95	194	ABBOTT	98E D0	First generation
>202	95	195	ABE	98S CDF	Second generation
> 99	95	196	ABE	97F CDF	Third generation
> 45.5	95	197,198	ABREU	93J DLPH	First + second generation
> 44.4	95	199	ADRIANI	93M L3	First generation
> 44.6	95	200	ADRIANI	93M L3	Third generation
> 44	95	199	DECAMP	92 ALEP	First or second generation
> 45	95	199	DECAMP	92 ALEP	Third generation
> 44.2	95	199	ALEXANDER	91 OPAL	First or second generation
> 41.4	95	199	ALEXANDER	91 OPAL	Third generation
● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ●					
> 94	95	201	ABBOTT	98J D0	Third generation
>225	95	202	ABBOTT	97B D0	Result included in ABBOTT 98E
>213	95	202	ABE	97X CDF	First generation
>119	95	203	ABACHI	95G D0	Second generation
>131	95	204	ABE	95U CDF	Second generation
>116	95	205	ABACHI	94B D0	First generation
> 80	95	206	ABE	93I CDF	First generation
> 44.5	95	199	ADRIANI	93M L3	Second generation
> 42.1	95	207	ABREU	92F DLPH	Second generation
> 74	95	208	ALITTI	92E UA2	First generation
> 43.2	95	199	ADEVA	91B L3	First generation
> 43.4	95	199	ADEVA	91B L3	Second generation
none 8.9–22.6	95	209	KIM	90 AMY	First generation
none 10.2–23.2	95	209	KIM	90 AMY	Second generation
none 5–20.8	95	210	BARTEL	87B JADE	
none 7–20.5	95	2	211 BEHREND	86B CELL	

<sup>194</sup> ABBOTT 98E search for scalar leptoquarks using  $e\nu jj$ ,  $eejj$ , and  $\nu\nu jj$  events in  $p\bar{p}$  collisions at  $E_{\text{cm}}=1.8$  TeV. The limit above assumes  $B(eq)=1$ . For  $B(eq)=0.5$  and 0, the bound becomes 204 and 79 GeV, respectively.

<sup>195</sup> ABE 98S search for scalar leptoquarks using  $\mu\mu jj$  events in  $p\bar{p}$  collisions at  $E_{\text{cm}}=1.8$  TeV. The limit is for  $B(\mu q)=1$ . For  $B(\mu q)=B(\nu q)=0.5$ , the limit is  $> 160$  GeV.

<sup>196</sup> ABE 97F search for third generation scalar and vector leptoquarks in  $p\bar{p}$  collisions at  $E_{\text{cm}}=1.8$  TeV. The quoted limit is for scalar leptoquark with  $B(\tau b)=1$ .

<sup>197</sup> Limit is for charge  $-1/3$  isospin-0 leptoquark with  $B(\ell q)=2/3$ .

<sup>198</sup> First and second generation leptoquarks are assumed to be degenerate. The limit is slightly lower for each generation.

<sup>199</sup> Limits are for charge  $-1/3$ , isospin-0 scalar leptoquarks decaying to  $\ell^- q$  or  $\nu q$  with any branching ratio. See paper for limits for other charge-isospin assignments of leptoquarks.

<sup>200</sup> ADRIANI 93M limit for charge  $-1/3$ , isospin-0 leptoquark decaying to  $\tau b$ .

- 201 ABBOTT 98J search for charge  $-1/3$  third generation scalar and vector leptoquarks in  $p\bar{p}$  collisions at  $E_{cm}=1.8$  TeV. The quoted limit is for scalar leptoquark with  $B(\nu b)=1$ .
- 202 ABBOTT 97B, ABE 97X search for scalar leptoquarks using  $e e j j$  events in  $p\bar{p}$  collisions at  $E_{cm}=1.8$  TeV. The limit is for  $B(e q)=1$ .
- 203 ABACHI 95G search for scalar leptoquarks using  $\mu\mu$ +jets and  $\mu\nu_\mu$ +jets events in  $p\bar{p}$  collisions at  $E_{cm}=1.8$  TeV. The limit is for  $B(\mu q)=1$ . For  $B(\mu q)=B(\nu q)=0.5$ , the limit is  $>97$  GeV.
- 204 ABE 95U search for scalar leptoquarks of charge  $Q=2/3$  and  $-1/3$  using  $\mu\mu j j$  events in  $p\bar{p}$  collisions at  $E_{cm}=1.8$  TeV. The limit is for  $B(\mu q)=1$ . For  $B(\mu q)=B(\nu q)=0.5$ , the limit is  $>96$  GeV.
- 205 ABACHI 94B search for  $e e j j$  and  $e\nu j j$  events in  $p\bar{p}$  collisions at  $E_{cm}=1.8$  TeV. ABACHI 94B obtain the limit  $>120$  GeV for  $B(e q)=B(\nu q)=0.5$  and  $>133$  GeV for  $B(e q)=1$ . A change in the  $D\emptyset$  luminosity monitor constant reduces the first bound to  $>116$  GeV quoted above (see FERMILAB-TM-1911). This limit does not depend on the electroweak quantum numbers of the leptoquark.
- 206 ABE 93I search for  $\ell\ell j j$  events in  $p\bar{p}$  collisions at  $E_{cm}=1.8$  TeV. The limit is for  $B(e q)=B(\nu q)=0.5$  and improves to  $>113$  GeV for  $B(e q)=1$ . This limit does not depend on electroweak quantum numbers of the leptoquark.
- 207 ABREU 92F limit is for charge  $-1/3$  isosin-0 leptoquark with  $B(\mu q)=2/3$ . If first and second generation leptoquarks are degenerate, the limit is 43.0 GeV, and for a charge  $2/3$  second generation leptoquark 43.4 GeV. Cross-section limit for pair production of states decaying to  $\ell q$  is given in the paper.
- 208 ALITTI 92E search for  $\ell\ell j j$  and  $\ell\nu j j$  events in  $p\bar{p}$  collisions at  $E_{cm}=630$  GeV. The limit is for  $B(e q)=1$  and is reduced to 67 GeV for  $B(e q)=B(\nu q)=0.5$ . This limit does not depend on electroweak quantum numbers of the leptoquark.
- 209 KIM 90 assume pair production of charge  $2/3$  scalar-leptoquark via photon exchange. The decay of the first (second) generation leptoquark is assumed to be any mixture of  $d e^+$  and  $u\bar{\nu}$  ( $s\mu^+$  and  $c\bar{\nu}$ ). See paper for limits for specific branching ratios.
- 210 BARTEL 87B limit is valid when a pair of charge  $2/3$  spinless leptoquarks X is produced with point coupling, and when they decay under the constraint  $B(X \rightarrow c\bar{\nu}_\mu) + B(X \rightarrow s\mu^+) = 1$ .
- 211 BEHREND 86B assumed that a charge  $2/3$  spinless leptoquark,  $\chi$ , decays either into  $s\mu^+$  or  $c\bar{\nu}$ :  $B(\chi \rightarrow s\mu^+) + B(\chi \rightarrow c\bar{\nu}) = 1$ .

## MASS LIMITS for Leptoquarks from Single Production

These limits depend on the  $q$ - $\ell$ -leptoquark coupling  $g_{LQ}$ . It is often assumed that  $g_{LQ}^2/4\pi=1/137$ . Limits shown are for a scalar, weak isoscalar, charge  $-1/3$  leptoquark.

VALUE (GeV)	CL%	DOCUMENT ID	TECN	COMMENT
<b>&gt;237</b>	95	212 AID	96B H1	First generation
<b>&gt; 73</b>	95	213 ABREU	93J DLPH	Second generation
● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ●				
		214 DERRICK	97 ZEUS	Lepton-flavor violation
>230	95	215 AHMED	94B H1	Sup. by AID 96B
> 65	95	213 ABREU	93J DLPH	First generation
>181	95	216 ABT	93 H1	First generation
>168	95	217 DERRICK	93 ZEUS	First generation

- 212 The quoted limit is for a left-handed scalar leptoquark which solely couples to the first generation with electromagnetic strength. AID 96B also search for leptoquarks with lepton-flavor violating couplings. For limits on states with different quantum numbers and the limits in the coupling-mass plane, see their Fig. 2, Fig. 3, and Table 2. AID 96B supersedes AHMED 94B.

- 213 Limit from single production in  $Z$  decay. The limit is for a leptoquark coupling of electromagnetic strength and assumes  $B(\ell q) = 2/3$ . The limit is 77 GeV if first and second leptoquarks are degenerate.
- 214 DERRICK 97 search for various leptoquarks with lepton-flavor violating couplings. See their Figs. 5–8 and Table 1 for detailed limits.
- 215 AHMED 94B limit is for the left-handed leptoquark decaying to  $eq$  and  $\nu q$  with  $B(eq) = B(\nu q) = 1/2$ . Electromagnetic coupling strength is assumed for the scalar leptoquark interaction. For limits on states with different quantum numbers and the limits in the coupling-mass plane, see their Table 2 and Fig. 6.
- 216 ABT 93 search for single leptoquark production in  $ep$  collisions with the decays  $eq$  and  $\nu q$ . The limit is for a leptoquark coupling of electromagnetic strength and assumes  $B(eq) = B(\nu q) = 1/2$ . The limit for  $B(eq) = 1$  is 178 GeV. For limits on states with different quantum numbers, see their Fig. 2. ABT 93 superseded by AHMED 94B.
- 217 DERRICK 93 search for single leptoquark production in  $ep$  collisions with the decay  $eq$  and  $\nu q$ . The limit is for leptoquark coupling of electromagnetic strength and assumes  $B(eq) = B(\nu q) = 1/2$ . The limit for  $B(eq) = 1$  is 176 GeV. For limits on states with different quantum numbers, see their Table 3.

### Indirect Limits for Leptoquarks

VALUE (TeV)	CL%	DOCUMENT ID	TECN	COMMENT
● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ●				
		218 ABBIENDI	99 OPAL	
		219 ACCIARRI	98J L3	$e^+e^- \rightarrow q\bar{q}$
		220 ACKERSTAFF	98V OPAL	$e^+e^- \rightarrow q\bar{q},$ $\tilde{e}^+e^- \rightarrow b\bar{b}$
> 0.76	95	221 DEANDREA	97 RVUE	$\tilde{R}_2$ leptoquark
		222 DERRICK	97 ZEUS	Lepton-flavor violation
		223 GROSSMAN	97 RVUE	$B \rightarrow \tau^+\tau^-$ (X)
		224 JADACH	97 RVUE	$e^+e^- \rightarrow q\bar{q}$
> 0.31	95	225 AID	95 H1	First generation
>1200		226 KUZNETSOV	95B RVUE	Pati-Salam type
		227 MIZUKOSHI	95 RVUE	Third generation scalar leptoquark
> 0.3	95	228 BHATTACH...	94 RVUE	Spin-0 leptoquark coupled to $\bar{e}_R t_L$
		229 DAVIDSON	94 RVUE	
> 18		230 KUZNETSOV	94 RVUE	Pati-Salam type
> 0.43	95	231 LEURER	94 RVUE	First generation spin-1 leptoquark
> 0.44	95	231 LEURER	94B RVUE	First generation spin-0 leptoquark
		232 MAHANTA	94 RVUE	$P$ and $T$ violation
> 350		233 DESHPANDE	83 RVUE	Sup. by KUZNETSOV 95B
> 1		234 SHANKER	82 RVUE	Nonchiral spin-0 leptoquark
> 125		234 SHANKER	82 RVUE	Nonchiral spin-1 leptoquark

218 ABBIENDI 99 limits are from  $e^+e^- \rightarrow q\bar{q}$  cross section at 130–136, 161–172, 183 GeV. See their Fig. 8 and Fig. 9 for limits in mass-coupling plane.

219 ACCIARRI 98J limit is from  $e^+e^- \rightarrow q\bar{q}$  cross section at  $\sqrt{s} = 130$ –172 GeV which can be affected by the  $t$ - and  $u$ -channel exchanges of leptoquarks. See their Fig. 4 and Fig. 5 for limits in the mass-coupling plane.

- 220 ACKERSTAFF 98V limits are from  $e^+e^- \rightarrow q\bar{q}$  and  $e^+e^- \rightarrow b\bar{b}$  cross sections at  $\sqrt{s} = 130\text{--}172$  GeV, which can be affected by the  $t$ - and  $u$ -channel exchanges of leptoquarks. See their Fig. 21 and Fig. 22 for limits of leptoquarks in mass-coupling plane.
- 221 DEANDREA 97 limit is for  $\tilde{R}_2$  leptoquark obtained from atomic parity violation (APV). The coupling of leptoquark is assumed to be electromagnetic strength. See Table 2 for limits of the four-fermion interactions induced by various scalar leptoquark exchange. DEANDREA 97 combines APV limit and limits from Tevatron and HERA. See Fig. 1–4 for combined limits of leptoquark in mass-coupling plane.
- 222 DERRICK 97 search for lepton-flavor violation in  $e p$  collision. See their Tables 2–5 for limits on lepton-flavor violating four-fermion interactions induced by various leptoquarks.
- 223 GROSSMAN 97 estimate the upper bounds on the branching fraction  $B \rightarrow \tau^+\tau^- (X)$  from the absence of the  $B$  decay with large missing energy. These bounds can be used to constrain leptoquark induced four-fermion interactions.
- 224 JADACH 97 limit is from  $e^+e^- \rightarrow q\bar{q}$  cross section at  $\sqrt{s}=172.3$  GeV which can be affected by the  $t$ - and  $u$ -channel exchanges of leptoquarks. See their Fig. 1 for limits on vector leptoquarks in mass-coupling plane.
- 225 AID 95 limit is for the weak isotriplet spin-1 leptoquark with the electromagnetic coupling strength. For the limits of leptoquarks with different quantum number, see their Table 2. AID 95 limits are from the measurements of the  $Q^2$  spectrum measurement of  $e p \rightarrow e X$ .
- 226 KUZNETSOV 95B use  $\pi, K, B, \tau$  decays and  $\mu e$  conversion and give a list of bounds on the leptoquark mass and the fermion mixing matrix in the Pati-Salam model. The quoted limit is from  $K_L \rightarrow \mu e$  decay assuming zero mixing. See also KUZNETSOV 94, DESHPANDE 83, and DIMOPOULOS 81.
- 227 MIZUKOSHI 95 calculate the one-loop radiative correction to the  $Z$ -physics parameters in various scalar leptoquark models. See their Fig. 4 for the exclusion plot of third generation leptoquark models in mass-coupling plane.
- 228 BHATTACHARYYA 94 limit is from one-loop radiative correction to the leptonic decay width of the  $Z$ .  $m_H=250$  GeV,  $\alpha_s(m_Z)=0.12$ ,  $m_t=180$  GeV, and the electroweak strength of leptoquark coupling are assumed. For leptoquark coupled to  $\bar{e}_L t_R, \bar{\mu} t$ , and  $\bar{\tau} t$ , see Fig. 2 in BHATTACHARYYA 94B erratum and Fig. 3.
- 229 DAVIDSON 94 gives an extensive list of the bounds on leptoquark-induced four-fermion interactions from  $\pi, K, D, B, \mu, \tau$  decays and meson mixings, *etc.* See Table 15 of DAVIDSON 94 for detail.
- 230 KUZNETSOV 94 gives mixing independent bound of the Pati-Salam leptoquark from the cosmological limit on  $\pi^0 \rightarrow \bar{\nu}\nu$ .
- 231 LEURER 94, LEURER 94B limits are obtained from atomic parity violation and apply to any chiral leptoquark which couples to the first generation with electromagnetic strength. For a nonchiral leptoquark, universality in  $\pi_{\ell 2}$  decay provides a much more stringent bound. See also SHANKER 82.
- 232 MAHANTA 94 gives bounds of  $P$ - and  $T$ -violating scalar-leptoquark couplings from atomic and molecular experiments.
- 233 DESHPANDE 83 used upper limit on  $K_L^0 \rightarrow \mu e$  decay with renormalization-group equations to estimate coupling at the heavy boson mass. See also DIMOPOULOS 81.
- 234 From  $(\pi \rightarrow e\nu)/(\pi \rightarrow \mu\nu)$  ratio. SHANKER 82 assumes the leptoquark induced four-fermion coupling  $4g^2/M^2 (\bar{\nu}_{eL} u_R) (\bar{d}_L e_R)$  with  $g=0.004$  for spin-0 leptoquark and  $g^2/M^2 (\bar{\nu}_{eL} \gamma_\mu u_L) (\bar{d}_R \gamma^\mu e_R)$  with  $g \simeq 0.6$  for spin-1 leptoquark.

## MASS LIMITS for Diquarks

VALUE (GeV)	CL%	DOCUMENT ID	TECN	COMMENT
• • • We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. • • •				
none 290–420	95	235 ABE	97G CDF	$E_6$ diquark
none 15–31.7	95	236 ABREU	940 DLPH	SUSY $E_6$ diquark

235 ABE 97G search for new particle decaying to dijets.

236 ABREU 940 limit is from  $e^+e^- \rightarrow \bar{c}\bar{c}s$ . Range extends up to 43 GeV if diquarks are degenerate in mass.

### MASS LIMITS for $g_A$ (axigluon)

Axigluons are massive color-octet gauge bosons in chiral color models and have axial-vector coupling to quarks with the same coupling strength as gluons.

VALUE (GeV)	CL%	DOCUMENT ID	TECN	COMMENT
-------------	-----	-------------	------	---------

• • • We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. • • •

>365	95	237 DONCHESKI	98 RVUE	$\Gamma(Z \rightarrow \text{hadron})$
none 200–980	95	238 ABE	97G CDF	$p\bar{p} \rightarrow g_A X, X \rightarrow 2 \text{ jets}$
none 200–870	95	239 ABE	95N CDF	$p\bar{p} \rightarrow g_A X, g_A \rightarrow q\bar{q}$
none 240–640	95	240 ABE	93G CDF	$p\bar{p} \rightarrow g_A X, g_A \rightarrow 2\text{jets}$
> 50	95	241 CUYPERS	91 RVUE	$\sigma(e^+e^- \rightarrow \text{hadrons})$
none 120–210	95	242 ABE	90H CDF	$p\bar{p} \rightarrow g_A X, g_A \rightarrow 2\text{jets}$
> 29		243 ROBINETT	89 THEO	Partial-wave unitarity
none 150–310	95	244 ALBAJAR	88B UA1	$p\bar{p} \rightarrow g_A X, g_A \rightarrow 2\text{jets}$
> 20		BERGSTROM	88 RVUE	$p\bar{p} \rightarrow \gamma X$ via $g_A g$
> 9		245 CUYPERS	88 RVUE	$\gamma$ decay
> 25		246 DONCHESKI	88B RVUE	$\gamma$ decay

237 DONCHESKI 98 compare  $\alpha_s$  derived from low-energy data and that from  $\Gamma(Z \rightarrow \text{hadrons})/\Gamma(Z \rightarrow \text{leptons})$ .

238 ABE 97G search for new particle decaying to dijets.

239 ABE 95N assume axigluons decaying to quarks in the Standard Model only.

240 ABE 93G assume  $\Gamma(g_A) = N\alpha_s m_{g_A}/6$  with  $N = 10$ .

241 CUYPERS 91 compare  $\alpha_s$  measured in  $\gamma$  decay and that from  $R$  at PEP/PETRA energies.

242 ABE 90H assumes  $\Gamma(g_A) = N\alpha_s m_{g_A}/6$  with  $N = 5$  ( $\Gamma(g_A) = 0.09m_{g_A}$ ). For  $N = 10$ , the excluded region is reduced to 120–150 GeV.

243 ROBINETT 89 result demands partial-wave unitarity of  $J = 0$   $t\bar{t} \rightarrow t\bar{t}$  scattering amplitude and derives a limit  $m_{g_A} > 0.5 m_t$ . Assumes  $m_t > 56$  GeV.

244 ALBAJAR 88B result is from the nonobservation of a peak in two-jet invariant mass distribution.  $\Gamma(g_A) < 0.4 m_{g_A}$  assumed. See also BAGGER 88.

245 CUYPERS 88 requires  $\Gamma(\gamma \rightarrow g g_A) < \Gamma(\gamma \rightarrow g g g)$ . A similar result is obtained by DONCHESKI 88.

246 DONCHESKI 88B requires  $\Gamma(\gamma \rightarrow g q\bar{q})/\Gamma(\gamma \rightarrow g g g) < 0.25$ , where the former decay proceeds via axigluon exchange. A more conservative estimate of  $< 0.5$  leads to  $m_{g_A} > 21$  GeV.

## $X^0$ (Heavy Boson) Searches in Z Decays

Searches for radiative transition of Z to a lighter spin-0 state  $X^0$  decaying to hadrons, a lepton pair, a photon pair, or invisible particles as shown in the comments. The limits are for the product of branching ratios.

VALUE	CL%	DOCUMENT ID	TECN	COMMENT
● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ●				
		247 BARATE	98U ALEP	$X^0 \rightarrow \ell\bar{\ell}, q\bar{q}, gg, \gamma\gamma,$
		248 ACCIARRI	97Q L3	$X^0 \rightarrow \nu\bar{\nu}$ invisible particle(s)
		249 ACTON	93E OPAL	$X^0 \rightarrow \gamma\gamma$
		250 ABREU	92D DLPH	$X^0 \rightarrow$ hadrons
		251 ADRIANI	92F L3	$X^0 \rightarrow$ hadrons
		252 ACTON	91 OPAL	$X^0 \rightarrow$ anything
$<1.1 \times 10^{-4}$	95	253 ACTON	91B OPAL	$X^0 \rightarrow e^+e^-$
$<9 \times 10^{-5}$	95	253 ACTON	91B OPAL	$X^0 \rightarrow \mu^+\mu^-$
$<1.1 \times 10^{-4}$	95	253 ACTON	91B OPAL	$X^0 \rightarrow \tau^+\tau^-$
$<2.8 \times 10^{-4}$	95	254 ADEVA	91D L3	$X^0 \rightarrow e^+e^-$
$<2.3 \times 10^{-4}$	95	254 ADEVA	91D L3	$X^0 \rightarrow \mu^+\mu^-$
$<4.7 \times 10^{-4}$	95	255 ADEVA	91D L3	$X^0 \rightarrow$ hadrons
$<8 \times 10^{-4}$	95	256 AKRAWY	90J OPAL	$X^0 \rightarrow$ hadrons

247 BARATE 98U obtain limits on  $B(Z \rightarrow \gamma X^0)B(X^0 \rightarrow \ell\bar{\ell}, q\bar{q}, gg, \gamma\gamma, \nu\bar{\nu})$ . See their Fig. 17.

248 See Fig. 4 of ACCIARRI 97Q for the upper limit on  $B(Z \rightarrow \gamma X^0; E_\gamma > E_{\min})$  as a function of  $E_{\min}$ .

249 ACTON 93E give  $\sigma(e^+e^- \rightarrow X^0\gamma) \cdot B(X^0 \rightarrow \gamma\gamma) < 0.4$  pb (95%CL) for  $m_{X^0} = 60 \pm 2.5$  GeV. If the process occurs via s-channel  $\gamma$  exchange, the limit translates to  $\Gamma(X^0) \cdot B(X^0 \rightarrow \gamma\gamma)^2 < 20$  MeV for  $m_{X^0} = 60 \pm 1$  GeV.

250 ABREU 92D give  $\sigma_Z \cdot B(Z \rightarrow \gamma X^0) \cdot B(X^0 \rightarrow \text{hadrons}) < (3-10)$  pb for  $m_{X^0} = 10-78$  GeV. A very similar limit is obtained for spin-1  $X^0$ .

251 ADRIANI 92F search for isolated  $\gamma$  in hadronic Z decays. The limit  $\sigma_Z \cdot B(Z \rightarrow \gamma X^0) \cdot B(X^0 \rightarrow \text{hadrons}) < (2-10)$  pb (95%CL) is given for  $m_{X^0} = 25-85$  GeV.

252 ACTON 91 searches for  $Z \rightarrow Z^* X^0, Z^* \rightarrow e^+e^-, \mu^+\mu^-,$  or  $\nu\bar{\nu}$ . Excludes any new scalar  $X^0$  with  $m_{X^0} < 9.5$  GeV/c if it has the same coupling to  $Z Z^*$  as the MSM Higgs boson.

253 ACTON 91B limits are for  $m_{X^0} = 60-85$  GeV.

254 ADEVA 91D limits are for  $m_{X^0} = 30-89$  GeV.

255 ADEVA 91D limits are for  $m_{X^0} = 30-86$  GeV.

256 AKRAWY 90J give  $\Gamma(Z \rightarrow \gamma X^0) \cdot B(X^0 \rightarrow \text{hadrons}) < 1.9$  MeV (95%CL) for  $m_{X^0} = 32-80$  GeV. We divide by  $\Gamma(Z) = 2.5$  GeV to get product of branching ratios. For nonresonant transitions, the limit is  $B(Z \rightarrow \gamma q\bar{q}) < 8.2$  MeV assuming three-body phase space distribution.

## MASS LIMITS for a Heavy Neutral Boson Coupling to $e^+ e^-$

VALUE (GeV)	CL%	DOCUMENT ID	TECN	COMMENT
● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ●				
none 55–61		257 ODAKA	89 VNS	$\Gamma(X^0 \rightarrow e^+ e^-)$ $\cdot B(X^0 \rightarrow \text{hadrons}) \gtrsim$ $0.2 \text{ MeV}$
>45	95	258 DERRICK	86 HRS	$\Gamma(X^0 \rightarrow e^+ e^-) = 6 \text{ MeV}$
>46.6	95	259 ADEVA	85 MRKJ	$\Gamma(X^0 \rightarrow e^+ e^-) = 10 \text{ keV}$
>48	95	259 ADEVA	85 MRKJ	$\Gamma(X^0 \rightarrow e^+ e^-) = 4 \text{ MeV}$
		260 BERGER	85B PLUT	
none 39.8–45.5		261 ADEVA	84 MRKJ	$\Gamma(X^0 \rightarrow e^+ e^-) = 10 \text{ keV}$
>47.8	95	261 ADEVA	84 MRKJ	$\Gamma(X^0 \rightarrow e^+ e^-) = 4 \text{ MeV}$
none 39.8–45.2		261 BEHREND	84C CELL	
>47	95	261 BEHREND	84C CELL	$\Gamma(X^0 \rightarrow e^+ e^-) = 4 \text{ MeV}$

257 ODAKA 89 looked for a narrow or wide scalar resonance in  $e^+ e^- \rightarrow \text{hadrons}$  at  $E_{\text{cm}} = 55.0\text{--}60.8 \text{ GeV}$ .

258 DERRICK 86 found no deviation from the Standard Model Bhabha scattering at  $E_{\text{cm}} = 29 \text{ GeV}$  and set limits on the possible scalar boson  $e^+ e^-$  coupling. See their figure 4 for excluded region in the  $\Gamma(X^0 \rightarrow e^+ e^-) - m_{X^0}$  plane. Electronic chiral invariance requires a parity doublet of  $X^0$ , in which case the limit applies for  $\Gamma(X^0 \rightarrow e^+ e^-) = 3 \text{ MeV}$ .

259 ADEVA 85 first limit is from  $2\gamma, \mu^+ \mu^-$ , hadrons assuming  $X^0$  is a scalar. Second limit is from  $e^+ e^-$  channel.  $E_{\text{cm}} = 40\text{--}47 \text{ GeV}$ . Supersedes ADEVA 84.

260 BERGER 85B looked for effect of spin-0 boson exchange in  $e^+ e^- \rightarrow e^+ e^-$  and  $\mu^+ \mu^-$  at  $E_{\text{cm}} = 34.7 \text{ GeV}$ . See Fig. 5 for excluded region in the  $m_{X^0} - \Gamma(X^0)$  plane.

261 ADEVA 84 and BEHREND 84C have  $E_{\text{cm}} = 39.8\text{--}45.5 \text{ GeV}$ . MARK-J searched  $X^0$  in  $e^+ e^- \rightarrow \text{hadrons}, 2\gamma, \mu^+ \mu^-, e^+ e^-$  and CELLO in the same channels plus  $\tau$  pair. No narrow or broad  $X^0$  is found in the energy range. They also searched for the effect of  $X^0$  with  $m_{X^0} > E_{\text{cm}}$ . The second limits are from Bhabha data and for spin-0 singlet. The same limits apply for  $\Gamma(X^0 \rightarrow e^+ e^-) = 2 \text{ MeV}$  if  $X^0$  is a spin-0 doublet. The second limit of BEHREND 84C was read off from their figure 2. The original papers also list limits in other channels.

## Search for $X^0$ Resonance in $e^+ e^-$ Collisions

The limit is for  $\Gamma(X^0 \rightarrow e^+ e^-) \cdot B(X^0 \rightarrow f)$ , where  $f$  is the specified final state.

Spin 0 is assumed for  $X^0$ .

VALUE (keV)	CL%	DOCUMENT ID	TECN	COMMENT
● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ●				
$<10^3$	95	262 ABE	93C VNS	$\Gamma(ee)$
$<(0.4\text{--}10)$	95	263 ABE	93C VNS	$f = \gamma\gamma$
$<(0.3\text{--}5)$	95	264,265 ABE	93D TOPZ	$f = \gamma\gamma$
$<(2\text{--}12)$	95	264,265 ABE	93D TOPZ	$f = \text{hadrons}$
$<(4\text{--}200)$	95	265,266 ABE	93D TOPZ	$f = ee$
$<(0.1\text{--}6)$	95	265,266 ABE	93D TOPZ	$f = \mu\mu$
$<(0.5\text{--}8)$	90	267 STERNER	93 AMY	$f = \gamma\gamma$

262 Limit is for  $\Gamma(X^0 \rightarrow e^+ e^-) m_{X^0} = 56\text{--}63.5 \text{ GeV}$  for  $\Gamma(X^0) = 0.5 \text{ GeV}$ .

- 263 Limit is for  $m_{X^0} = 56\text{--}61.5$  GeV and is valid for  $\Gamma(X^0) \ll 100$  MeV. See their Fig. 5 for limits for  $\Gamma = 1,2$  GeV.
- 264 Limit is for  $m_{X^0} = 57.2\text{--}60$  GeV.
- 265 Limit is valid for  $\Gamma(X^0) \ll 100$  MeV. See paper for limits for  $\Gamma = 1$  GeV and those for  $J = 2$  resonances.
- 266 Limit is for  $m_{X^0} = 56.6\text{--}60$  GeV.
- 267 STERNER 93 limit is for  $m_{X^0} = 57\text{--}59.6$  GeV and is valid for  $\Gamma(X^0) < 100$  MeV. See their Fig. 2 for limits for  $\Gamma = 1,3$  GeV.

### Search for $X^0$ Resonance in Two-Photon Process

The limit is for  $\Gamma(X^0) \cdot B(X^0 \rightarrow \gamma\gamma)^2$ . Spin 0 is assumed for  $X^0$ .

VALUE (MeV)	CL%	DOCUMENT ID	TECN	COMMENT
● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ●				
<2.6	95	268 ACTON	93E OPAL	$m_{X^0} = 60 \pm 1$ GeV
<2.9	95	BUSKULIC	93F ALEP	$m_{X^0} \sim 60$ GeV

268 ACTON 93E limit for a  $J = 2$  resonance is 0.8 MeV.

### Search for $X^0$ Resonance in $e^+ e^- \rightarrow X^0 \gamma$

VALUE (GeV)	DOCUMENT ID	TECN	COMMENT
-------------	-------------	------	---------

● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ●

269 ADAM 96C DLPH  $X^0$  decaying invisibly

269 ADAM 96C is from the single photon production cross at  $\sqrt{s} = 130, 136$  GeV. The upper bound is less than 3 pb for  $X^0$  masses between 60 and 130 GeV. See their Fig. 5 for the exact bound on the cross section  $\sigma(e^+ e^- \rightarrow \gamma X^0)$ .

### Search for $X^0$ Resonance in $Z \rightarrow f\bar{f}X^0$

The limit is for  $B(Z \rightarrow f\bar{f}X^0) \cdot B(X^0 \rightarrow F)$  where  $f$  is a fermion and  $F$  is the specified final state. Spin 0 is assumed for  $X^0$ .

VALUE (MeV)	CL%	DOCUMENT ID	TECN	COMMENT
-------------	-----	-------------	------	---------

● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ●

< $3.7 \times 10^{-6}$	95	270 ABREU	96T DLPH	$f=e,\mu,\tau; F=\gamma\gamma$
		271 ABREU	96T DLPH	$f=\nu; F=\gamma\gamma$
		272 ABREU	96T DLPH	$f=q; F=\gamma\gamma$
< $6.8 \times 10^{-6}$	95	271 ACTON	93E OPAL	$f=e,\mu,\tau; F=\gamma\gamma$
< $5.5 \times 10^{-6}$	95	271 ACTON	93E OPAL	$f=q; F=\gamma\gamma$
< $3.1 \times 10^{-6}$	95	271 ACTON	93E OPAL	$f=\nu; F=\gamma\gamma$
< $6.5 \times 10^{-6}$	95	271 ACTON	93E OPAL	$f=e,\mu; F=\ell\bar{\ell}, q\bar{q}, \nu\bar{\nu}$
< $7.1 \times 10^{-6}$	95	271 BUSKULIC	93F ALEP	$f=e,\mu; F=\ell\bar{\ell}, q\bar{q}, \nu\bar{\nu}$
		273 ADRIANI	92F L3	$f=q; F=\gamma\gamma$

270 ABREU 96T obtain limit as a function of  $m_{X^0}$ . See their Fig. 6.

271 Limit is for  $m_{X^0}$  around 60 GeV.

272 ABREU 96T obtain limit as a function of  $m_{X^0}$ . See their Fig. 15.

273 ADRIANI 92F give  $\sigma_Z \cdot B(Z \rightarrow q\bar{q}X^0) \cdot B(X^0 \rightarrow \gamma\gamma) < (0.75-1.5)$  pb (95%CL) for  $m_{X^0} = 10-70$  GeV. The limit is 1 pb at 60 GeV.

### Search for $X^0$ Resonance in $p\bar{p} \rightarrow WX^0$

VALUE (MeV)	DOCUMENT ID	TECN	COMMENT
● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ●			
	274 ABE	97W CDF	$X^0 \rightarrow b\bar{b}$
274 ABE 97W search for $X^0$ production associated with $W$ in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $E_{cm}=1.8$ TeV. The 95%CL upper limit on the production cross section times the branching ratio for $X^0 \rightarrow b\bar{b}$ ranges from 14 to 19 pb for $X^0$ mass between 70 and 120 GeV. See their Fig. 3 for upper limits of the production cross section as a function of $m_{X^0}$ .			

### Search for Resonance $X, Y$ in $e^+e^- \rightarrow XY$

VALUE (MeV)	DOCUMENT ID	TECN	COMMENT
● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ●			
	275 ACKERSTAFF 98X	OPAL	$X \rightarrow 2\text{jets}, Y \rightarrow 2\text{jets}$
	276 ACKERSTAFF 98Y	OPAL	$X \rightarrow \gamma\gamma, Y \rightarrow f\bar{f}$
	277 ALEXANDER 97B	OPAL	$X \rightarrow 2\text{ jets}, Y \rightarrow 2\text{ jets}$
	278 BUSKULIC,D 96	ALEP	$X \rightarrow 2\text{ jets}, Y \rightarrow 2\text{ jets}$
275 ACKERSTAFF 98X search for $e^+e^- \rightarrow XY \rightarrow 4\text{jets}$ at $\sqrt{s}=130-184$ GeV. The upper limits on $\sigma(e^+e^- \rightarrow XY)$ , which are well below the excess reported by BUSKULIC,D 96, are shown in their Fig. 5.			
276 ACKERSTAFF 98Y search for $e^+e^- \rightarrow XY$ , with $X \rightarrow \gamma\gamma, Y \rightarrow f\bar{f}$ where $f\bar{f}$ may be $q\bar{q}, \ell\bar{\ell}$ , or $\nu\bar{\nu}$ at $\sqrt{s}=183$ GeV. The upper limits on $\sigma(e^+e^- \rightarrow XY) \times B(X \rightarrow \gamma\gamma)$ are shown in their Fig. 4.			
277 ALEXANDER 97B search for the associated production of two massive particles decaying into quarks in $e^+e^-$ collisions at $\sqrt{s}=130-136$ GeV. The 95%CL upper limits on $\sigma(e^+e^- \rightarrow XY)$ range from 2.7 to 4.5 pb for $95 < m_X + m_Y < 120$ GeV.			
278 BUSKULIC,D 96 observed an excess of four-jet production cross section in $e^+e^-$ collisions at $\sqrt{s}=130-136$ GeV and find an enhancement in the sum of two dijet masses around 105 GeV.			

### Heavy Particle Production in Quarkonium Decays

Limits are for branching ratios to modes shown.

VALUE	CL%	DOCUMENT ID	TECN	COMMENT
● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ●				
$< 1.5 \times 10^{-5}$	90	279 BALEST	95 CLE2	$\Upsilon(1S) \rightarrow X^0\gamma,$ $m_{X^0} < 5$ GeV
$< 3 \times 10^{-5} - 6 \times 10^{-3}$	90	280 BALEST	95 CLE2	$\Upsilon(1S) \rightarrow X^0\bar{X}^0\gamma,$ $m_{X^0} < 3.9$ GeV
$< 5.6 \times 10^{-5}$	90	281 ANTREASYAN 90C	CBAL	$\Upsilon(1S) \rightarrow X^0\gamma,$ $m_{X^0} < 7.2$ GeV
		282 ALBRECHT	89 ARG	
279 BALEST 95 two-body limit is for pseudoscalar $X^0$ . The limit becomes $< 10^{-4}$ for $m_{X^0} < 7.7$ GeV.				

- 280 BALEST 95 three-body limit is for phase-space photon energy distribution and angular distribution same as for  $\Upsilon \rightarrow gg\gamma$ .
- 281 ANTREASYAN 90C assume that  $X^0$  does not decay in the detector.
- 282 ALBRECHT 89 give limits for  $B(\Upsilon(1S), \Upsilon(2S) \rightarrow X^0\gamma) \cdot B(X^0 \rightarrow \pi^+\pi^-, K^+K^-, p\bar{p})$  for  $m_{X^0} < 3.5$  GeV.

## REFERENCES FOR Searches for Heavy Bosons Other Than Higgs Bosons

ABBIENDI	99	EPJ C6 1	G. Abbiendi+	(OPAL Collab.)
ABBOTT	98E	PRL 80 2051	B. Abbott+	(D0 Collab.)
ABBOTT	98J	PRL 81 38	B. Abbott+	(D0 Collab.)
ABE	98S	PRL 81 4806	F. Abe+	(CDF Collab.)
ACCIARRI	98J	PL B433 163	M. Acciarri+	(L3 Collab.)
ACKERSTAFF	98V	EPJ C2 441	K. Ackerstaff+	(OPAL Collab.)
ACKERSTAFF	98X	PL B429 399	K. Ackerstaff+	(OPAL Collab.)
ACKERSTAFF	98Y	PL B437 218	K. Ackerstaff+	(OPAL Collab.)
BARATE	98U	EPJ C4 571	R. Barate+	(ALEPH Collab.)
BARENBOIM	98	EPJ C1 369	G. Barenboim	
CHO	98	EPJ C5 155	G. Cho, K. Hagiwara, S. Matsumoto	
CHO	98B	NP B531 65	G. Cho, K. Hagiwara, Y. Umeda	
CVETIC	98	hep-ph/9707451	M. Cvetic, P. Langacker	
Perspectives in Supersymmetry				
DONCHESKI	98	PR D58 097702	M.A. Doncheski, R.W. Robinett	
ABBOTT	97B	PRL 79 4321	+Abolins, Acharya+	(D0 Collab.)
ABE	97F	PRL 78 2906	+Akimoto, Akopian, Albrow, Amendolia+	(CDF Collab.)
ABE	97G	PR D55 R5263	+Akimoto, Akopian, Albrow, Amendolia+	(CDF Collab.)
ABE	97S	PRL 79 2192	+Akimoto, Akopian, Albrow, Amendolia+	(CDF Collab.)
ABE	97W	PRL 79 3819	F. Abe+	(CDF Collab.)
ABE	97X	PRL 79 4327	+Akimoto, Akopian, Albrow, Amadon+	(CDF Collab.)
ACCIARRI	97Q	PL B412 201	M. Acciarri+	(L3 Collab.)
ALEXANDER	97B	ZPHY C73 201	G. Alexander+	(OPAL Collab.)
ARIMA	97	PR D55 19	+Odaka, Ogawa, Shirai, Tsuboyama+	(VENUS Collab.)
BARATE	97B	PL B399 329	+Buskulic, Decamp, Ghez, Goy, Lees+	(ALEPH Collab.)
BARENBOIM	97	PR D55 4213	+Bernabeu, Prades, Raidal	(VALE, IFIC)
DEANDREA	97	PL B409 277		(MARS)
DERRICK	97	ZPHY C73 613	M. Derrick+	(ZEUS Collab.)
GROSSMAN	97	PR D55 2768	+Ligeti, Nardi	(REHO, CIT)
JADACH	97	PL B408 281	+Ward, Was	(CERN, INPK, TENN, SLAC)
STAHL	97	ZPHY C74 73	A. Stahl, H. Voss	(BONN)
ABACHI	96C	PRL 76 3271	+Abbott, Abolins, Acharya, Adam+	(D0 Collab.)
ABACHI	96D	PL B385 471	+Abbott, Abolins, Acharya, Adam+	(D0 Collab.)
ABREU	96T	ZPHY C72 179	+Adam, Adye, Agasi, Ajinenko, Aleksan+	(DELPHI Collab.)
ADAM	96C	PL B380 471	+Adye, Agasi, Ajinenko, Aleksan+	(DELPHI Collab.)
AID	96B	PL B369 173	+Andreev, Andrieu, Appuhn, Arpagaus+	(H1 Collab.)
ALLET	96	PL B383 139	+Bodek, Camps, Deutsch+	(VILL, LEUV, LOUV, WISC)
BUSKULIC	96N	PL B378 373	+De Bonis, Decamp, Ghez, Goy, Lees+	(ALEPH Collab.)
BUSKULIC,D	96	ZPHY C71 179	D. Buskulic+	(ALEPH Collab.)
ABACHI	95E	PL B358 405	+Abbott, Abolins, Acharya, Adam, Adams+	(D0 Collab.)
ABACHI	95G	PRL 75 3618	+Abbott, Abolins, Acharya, Adam, Adams+	(D0 Collab.)
ABE	95	PR D51 R949	+Albrow, Amidei, Antos, Anway-Wiese+	(CDF Collab.)
ABE	95M	PRL 74 2900	+Albrow, Amidei, Antos, Anway-Wiese+	(CDF Collab.)
ABE	95N	PRL 74 3538	+Albrow, Amendolia, Amidei, Antos+	(CDF Collab.)
ABE	95U	PRL 75 1012	+Albrow, Amendolia, Amidei, Antos+	(CDF Collab.)
ABREU	95M	ZPHY C65 603	+Adam, Adye, Agasi, Ajinenko+	(DELPHI Collab.)
AID	95	PL B353 578	+Andreev, Andrieu, Appuhn, Arpagaus+	(H1 Collab.)
BALEST	95	PR D51 2053	+Cho, Ford, Johnson+	(CLEO Collab.)
KUZNETSOV	95	PRL 75 794	+Serebrov, Stepanenko+	(PNPI, KIAE, HARV, NIST)
KUZNETSOV	95B	PAN 58 2113	+Mikheev	(YARO)
Translated from YAF 58 2228.				

MIZUKOSHI	95	NP B443 20	+Eboli, Gonzalez-Garcia	(SPAUL, CERN)
NARDI	95	PL B344 225	+Roulet, Tommasini	(MICH, CERN)
ABACHI	94B	PRL 72 965	+Abbott, Abolins, Acharya, Adam+	(D0 Collab.)
ABREU	94O	ZPHY C64 183	+Adam, Adye, Agasi, Ajinenko, Aleksan+	(DELPHI Collab.)
AHMED	94B	ZPHY C64 545	+Aid, Andreev, Andrieu, Appuhn, Arpagaus+	(H1 Collab.)
BHATTACH...	94	PL B336 100	Bhattacharyya, Ellis, Sridhar	(CERN)
Also	94B	PL B338 522 (erratum)	Bhattacharyya, Ellis, Sridhar	(CERN)
BHATTACH...	94B	PL B338 522 (erratum)	Bhattacharyya, Ellis, Sridhar	(CERN)
BUSKULIC	94	ZPHY C62 539	+Casper, De Bonis, Decamp, Ghez, Goy+	(ALEPH Collab.)
DAVIDSON	94	ZPHY C61 613	+Bailey, Campbell	(CFPA, TNTO, ALBE)
KUZNETSOV	94	PL B329 295	+Mikheev	(YARO)
KUZNETSOV	94B	JETPL 60 315	+Serebrov, Stepanenko+	(PNPI, KIAE, HARV, NIST)
		Translated from ZETFP 60 311.		
LEURER	94	PR D50 536		(REHO)
LEURER	94B	PR D49 333		(REHO)
Also	93	PRL 71 1324	Leurer	(REHO)
MAHANTA	94	PL B337 128		(MEHTA)
SEVERIJNS	94	PRL 73 611 (erratum)	+	(LOUV, WISC, LEUV, ETH, MASA)
VILAIN	94B	PL B332 465	+Wilquet, Beyer, Flegel, Grote+	(CHARM II Collab.)
ABE	93C	PL B302 119	+Amako, Arai, Arima, Asano, Chiba+	(VENUS Collab.)
ABE	93D	PL B304 373	+Adachi, Awa, Aoki, Belusevic, Emi+	(TOPAZ Collab.)
ABE	93G	PRL 71 2542	+Albrow, Akimoto, Amidei, Anway-Wiese+	(CDF Collab.)
ABE	93I	PR D48 R3939	+Albrow, Amidei, Anway-Wiese, Apollinari+	(CDF Collab.)
ABREU	93J	PL B316 620	+Adam, Adye, Agasi, Aleksan, Alekseev+	(DELPHI Collab.)
ABT	93	NP B396 3	+Andreev, Andrieu, Appuhn, Arpagaus+	(H1 Collab.)
ACTON	93E	PL B311 391	+Akers, Alexander+	(OPAL Collab.)
ADRIANI	93D	PL B306 187	+Aguilar-Benitez, Ahlen, Alcaraz, Aloisio+	(L3 Collab.)
ADRIANI	93M	PRPL 236 1	+Aguilar-Benitez, Ahlen, Alcaraz, Aloisio+	(L3 Collab.)
ALITTI	93	NP B400 3	+Ambrosini, Ansari, Autiero, Bareyre+	(UA2 Collab.)
ALLEN	93	PR D47 11	+Chen, Doe, Hausammann+	(UCI, LANL, ANL, UMD)
ALTARELLI	93B	PL B318 139	+Casalbuoni+	(CERN, FIRZ, GEVA, PADO)
BHATTACH...	93	PR D47 R3693	Bhattacharyya+	(CALC, JADA, ICTP, AHMED, BOSE)
BUSKULIC	93F	PL B308 425	+De Bonis, Decamp, Chez, Goy, Lees+	(ALEPH Collab.)
DERRICK	93	PL B306 173	+Krkauer, Magill, Musgrave, Repond+	(ZEUS Collab.)
RIZZO	93	PR D48 4470		(ANL)
SEVERIJNS	93	PR 70 4047	+Gimeno-Nogues+	(LOUV, WISC, LEUV, ETH, MASA)
Also	94	PRL 73 611 (erratum)	Severijns+	(LOUV, WISC, LEUV, ETH, MASA)
STERNER	93	PL B303 385	+Abashian, Gotow, Haim, Mattson, Morgan+	(AMY Collab.)
ABE	92B	PRL 68 1463	+Amidei, Apollinari, Atac, Auchincloss+	(CDF Collab.)
ABREU	92D	ZPHY C53 555	+Adam, Adami, Adye, Akesson, Alekseev+	(DELPHI Collab.)
ABREU	92F	PL B275 222	+Adam, Adami, Adye, Akesson, Alekseev+	(DELPHI Collab.)
ADRIANI	92F	PL B292 472	+Aguilar-Benitez, Ahlen, Akbari, Alcaraz+	(L3 Collab.)
ALITTI	92E	PL B274 507	+Ambrosini, Ansari, Autiero, Bareyre+	(UA2 Collab.)
DECAMP	92	PRPL 216 253	+Descizeaux, Goy, Lees, Minard+	(ALEPH Collab.)
DELAGUILA	92	NP B372 3	del Aguila+	(CERN, GRAN, MPIM, BRUXT, MADE)
Also	91C	NP B361 45	del Aguila, Moreno, Quiros	(BARC, MADE)
IMAZATO	92	PRL 69 877	+Kawashima, Tanaka+	(KEK, INUS, TOKY, TOKMS)
LANGACKER	92B	PR D45 278	+Luo	(PENN)
LAYSSAC	92	ZPHY C53 97	+Renard, Verzegnassi	(MONP, LAPP)
LAYSSAC	92B	PL B287 267	+Renard, Verzegnassi	(MONP, TRSTT)
LEIKE	92	PL B291 187	+Riemann, Riemann	(BERL, CERN)
LEP	92	PL B276 247	+ALEPH, DELPHI, L3, OPAL	(LEP Collabs.)
MISHRA	92	PRL 68 3499	+Leung, Arroyo+	(COLU, CHIC, FNAL, ROCH, WISC)
POLAK	92	PL B276 492	+Zralek	(SILES)
POLAK	92B	PR D46 3871	+Zralek	(SILES)
RENTON	92	ZPHY C56 355		(OXF)
ABE	91D	PRL 67 2418	+Amidei, Apollinari, Atac, Auchincloss+	(CDF Collab.)
ABE	91F	PRL 67 2609	+Amidei, Apollinari, Atac, Auchincloss+	(CDF Collab.)
ACTON	91	PL B268 122	+Alexander, Allison, Allport+	(OPAL Collab.)
ACTON	91B	PL B273 338	+Alexander, Allison, Allport, Anderson+	(OPAL Collab.)
ADEVA	91B	PL B261 169	+Adriani, Aguilar-Benitez, Akbari, Alcaraz+	(L3 Collab.)
ADEVA	91D	PL B262 155	+Adriani, Aguilar-Benitez, Akbari, Alcaraz+	(L3 Collab.)
ALEXANDER	91	PL B263 123	+Allison, Allport, Anderson, Arcelli+	(OPAL Collab.)
ALITTI	91	ZPHY C49 17	+Ansari, Ansorge, Autiero, Bareyre+	(UA2 Collab.)
ALTARELLI	91	PL B261 146	+Casalbuoni, De Curtis+	(CERN, FIRZ, GEVA)
ALTARELLI	91B	PL B263 459	+Casalbuoni, De Curtis+	(CERN, FIRZ, GEVA)
Also	90	PL B245 669	Altarelli, Casalbuoni, Feruglio, Gatto	(CERN, LECE, GEVA)
AQUINO	91	PL B261 280	+Fernandez, Garcia	(CINV, PUEB)
BUCHMUEL...	91	PL B267 395	Buchmueller, Greub, Minkowski	(DESY, BERN)

COLANGELO	91	PL B253 154	+Nardulli	(BARI)
CUYPERS	91	PL B259 173	+Falk, Frampton	(DURH, HARV, UNCCH)
DELAGUILA	91	PL B254 497	del Aguila, Moreno, Quiros	(BARC, MADE, CERN)
FARAGGI	91	MPL A6 61	+Nanopoulos	(TAMU)
GEIREGAT	91	PL B259 499	+Vilain, Wilquet, Binder, Burkard+	(CHARM II Collab.)
GONZALEZ-G...	91	PL B259 365	Gonzalez-Garcia, Valle	(VALE)
Also	90C	NP B345 312	Gonzalez-Garcia, Valle	(VALE)
MAHANTHAP...	91	PR D43 3093	Mahanthappa, Mohapatra	(COLO)
Also	91B	PR D44 1616	Mahanthappa, Mohapatra	(COLO)
POLAK	91	NP B363 385	+Zralek	(SILES)
RIZZO	91	PR D44 202		(WISC, ISU)
WALKER	91	APJ 376 51	+Steigman, Schramm, Olive+	(HSCA, OSU, CHIC, MINN)
ABE	90F	PL B246 297	+Amako, Arai, Asano, Chiba+	(VENUS Collab.)
ABE	90G	PRL 65 2243	+Amidei, Apollinari, Atac+	(CDF Collab.)
ABE	90H	PR D41 1722	+Amidei, Apollinari, Ascoli, Atac+	(CDF Collab.)
AKRAWY	90J	PL B246 285	+Alexander, Allison, Allport, Anderson+	(OPAL Collab.)
ALLEN	90	PRL 64 1330	+Chen, Doe+	(UCI, LASL, UMD)
ANTREASYAN	90C	PL B251 204	+Bartels, Besset, Bieler, Bienlein+	(Crystal Ball Collab.)
BARGER	90B	PR D42 152	+Hewett, Rizzo	(WISC, ISU)
GLASHOW	90	PR D42 3224	+Sarid	(HARV)
GLASHOW	90B	PRL 64 725	+Sarid	(HARV)
GONZALEZ-G...	90D	PL B240 163	Gonzalez-Garcia, Valle	(VALE)
GRIFOLS	90	NP B331 244	+Masso	(BARC)
GRIFOLS	90C	MPL A5 2657		(BARC)
GRIFOLS	90D	PR D42 3293	+Masso, Rizzo	(BARC, CERN, WISC, ISU)
HAGIWARA	90	PR D41 815	+Najima, Sakuda, Terunuma	(KEK, DURH, YCC, HIRO)
HE	90B	PL B240 441	+Joshi, Volkas	(MELB)
Also	90C	PL B244 580	He, Joshi, Volkas	(MELB)
KIM	90	PL B240 243	+Breedon, Ko, Lander, Maeshima, Malchow+	(AMY Collab.)
LOPEZ	90	PL B241 392	+Nanopoulos	(TAMU)
ALBAJAR	89	ZPHY C44 15	+Albrow, Allkofer, Arnison, Astbury+	(UA1 Collab.)
ALBRECHT	89	ZPHY C42 349	+Boeckmann, Glaeser, Harder+	(ARGUS Collab.)
BARBIERI	89B	PR D39 1229	+Mohapatra	(PISA, UMD)
DELAGUILA	89	PR D40 2481	del Aguila, Moreno, Quiros	(BARC, MADE)
Also	90B	PR D41 134	del Aguila, Moreno, Quiros	(BARC, MADE)
Also	90C	PR D42 262	del Aguila, Moreno, Quiros	(BARC, MADE)
DORENBOS...	89	ZPHY C41 567	Dorenbosch, Udo, Allaby, Amaldi+	(CHARM Collab.)
GEIREGAT	89	PL B232 539	+Vilain, Wilquet, Bergsma, Binder+	(CHARM II Collab.)
LANGACKER	89B	PR D40 1569	+Uma Sankar	(PENN)
ODAKA	89	JPSJ 58 3037	+Kondo, Abe, Amako+	(VENUS Collab.)
ROBINETT	89	PR D39 834		(PSU)
ALBAJAR	88B	PL B209 127	+Albrow, Allkofer, Astbury, Aubert+	(UA1 Collab.)
BAGGER	88	PR D37 1188	+Schmidt, King	(HARV, BOST)
BALKE	88	PR D37 587	+Gidal, Jodidio+	(LBL, UCB, COLO, NWES, TRIU)
BERGSTROM	88	PL B212 386		(STOH)
COSTA	88	NP B297 244	+Ellis, Fogli+	(PADO, CERN, BARI, WISC, LBL)
CUYPERS	88	PRL 60 1237	+Frampton	(UNCCH)
DONCHESKI	88	PL B206 137	+Grotch, Robinett	(PSU)
DONCHESKI	88B	PR D38 412	+Grotch, Robinett	(PSU)
ELLIS	88	PL B202 417	Ellis, Franzini, Zwirner	(CERN, UCB, LBL)
RAFFELT	88	PRL 60 1793	+Seckel	(UCB, LLL, UCSC)
AMALDI	87	PR D36 1385	+Bohm, Durkin, Langacker+	(CERN, AACH3, OSU+)
ANSARI	87D	PL B195 613	+Bagnaia, Banner+	(UA2 Collab.)
BARTEL	87B	ZPHY C36 15	+Becker, Felst+	(JADE Collab.)
MARCIANO	87	PR D35 1672	+Sirlin	(BNL, NYU)
ARNISON	86B	EPL 1 327	+Albrow, Allkofer+	(UA1 Collab.)
BARGER	86B	PRL 56 30	+Deshpande, Whisnant	(WISC, OREG, FSU)
BEHREND	86B	PL B178 452	+Buerger, Criegee, Fenner, Field+	(CELLO Collab.)
DERRICK	86	PL 166B 463	+Gan, Kooijman, Loos+	(HRS Collab.)
Also	86B	PR D34 3286	Derrick, Gan, Kooijman, Loos, Musgrave+	(HRS Collab.)
DURKIN	86	PL 166B 436	+Langacker	(PENN)
ELLIS	86	PL 167B 457	+Enqvist, Nanopoulos, Sarkar	(CERN, OXFTP)
JODIDIO	86	PR D34 1967	+Balke, Carr, Gidal, Shinsky+	(LBL, NWES, TRIU)
Also	88	PR D37 237	Jodidio, Balke, Carr+	(LBL, NWES, TRIU)
MOHAPATRA	86	PR D34 909		(UMD)
STEIGMAN	86	PL B176 33	+Olive, Schramm, Turner	(BART, MINN+)
ADEVA	85	PL 152B 439	+Becker, Becker-Szendy+	(Mark-J Collab.)
ADEVA	85B	PRL 55 665	+Becker, Becker-Szendy+	(Mark-J Collab.)
BERGER	85B	ZPHY C27 341	+Deuter, Genzel, Lackas, Pielorz+	(PLUTO Collab.)

STOKER	85	PRL 54 1887	+Balke, Carr, Gidal+	(LBL, NWES, TRIU)
ADEVA	84	PRL 53 134	+Barber, Becker, Berdugo+	(Mark-J Collab.)
BEHREND	84C	PL 140B 130	+Burger, Criegee, Fenner+	(CELLO Collab.)
ARNISON	83D	PL 129B 273	+Astbury, Aubert, Bacci+	(UA1 Collab.)
BERGSMA	83	PL 122B 465	+Dorenbosch, Jonker+	(CHARM Collab.)
CARR	83	PRL 51 627	+Gidal, Gobbi, Jodidio, Oram+	(LBL, NWES, TRIU)
DESHPANDE	83	PR D27 1193	+Johnson	(OREG)
BEALL	82	PRL 48 848	+Bander, Soni	(UCI, UCLA)
SHANKER	82	NP B204 375		(TRIU)
DIMOPOUL...	81	NP B182 77	Dimopoulos, Raby, Kane	(STAN, MICH)
RIZZO	81	PR D24 704	+Senjanovic	(BNL)
STEIGMAN	79	PRL 43 239	+Olive, Schramm	(BART, EFI)

---